I Introduction

For this project, we set out to explore the similarities and differences between traditional music of the Catskill Mountains and that of Southern Appalachia. We began this project knowing that the two regions share a number of songs containing the same, or similar, lyrics. We wanted to find out how large that body of shared song was, and if the accompanying music between the two regions was closely related as well.

We hoped to find connections between the two areas regarding transmission of repertoire, and to explore reasons for similarities and differences in order to contribute to the broader understanding of the development and definition of American folk music. In doing so, we hoped we might better understand how American folk music came about by exploring how musical culture traveled with people, whether and where musical cultures mixed and where they did not, and how this helped shape the national musical identity we call “American.”

As Catskill traditional musicians, the topic of how American folk music came to be defined and who did the defining has long piqued our interest. While folk music in the Catskills has had a long history, it is not really included in the perception of folk music held by the general public. This perception has always been largely Southern, white, and rural. If there was a long tradition of Catskill traditional music, and if the exclusion of Catskill traditional music is indicative of a larger trend, it might mean that folk music in America has always been more diversified than has been accepted.

In addition, we wanted to examine the similarities between these two seemingly disparate areas in order to understand connections between these two peoples. We also wanted to explore the differences, and the possible cultural and social reasons for those differences. Finally, we wanted to investigate the perception that traditional music in the Catskills consisted of nothing but Southern imports.

For musical comparison, we looked first for lyrics that were consistent between the Catskills and Southern Appalachia, and then examined the accompanying music.
Our study focused on songs rather than fiddle tunes; however, when in the course of research we came upon tunes common to both areas, we noted them as well.

II Two Places:

The Catskill Mountains are a large mountain range in central New York state. We are taking the broad definition and including not just the State Park, but all the lands within that mountain range and environs.

As for the Southern Appalachians, we accept the definition employed in practice by Cecil Sharp, and consider Southern Appalachia bordered on the north by Pennsylvania and on the south by the North Georgia Mountains. This was the definition used by the early collectors, and this is the area from which the songs we studied hailed.

Two Peoples

Folk music is inextricably linked to the people who create and practice it, so it is worthwhile to take a quick look at the populace and the history of the two regions of study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Southern Appalachia/KY</th>
<th>Catskills</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Major Period of Settlement</td>
<td>Initial: Virginia: Shenandoah Valley 1730’s. Kentucky: 1740’s. Larger settlement: early 1800’s, Scottish immigrants and migrants from coastal South and Northerners “going west.”</td>
<td>Initial: Small settlements mid 1700’s Larger settlement: early 1800’s, Scottish immigrants and migrants from New England.</td>
<td>Initial and later settlement happened at about the same time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>numbers of other ethnic groups.</td>
<td>numbers of other ethnic groups.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Way of Life</strong></td>
<td>Agrarian and hunting–based, later, mining. Appropriation of resources (coal) by large interests. Tends toward conservative politics.</td>
<td>Agrarian, hunting–based, later tanning, lumbering. Appropriation of resources (water, gas) by large interests. Tends toward conservative politics.</td>
<td>Similar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Language usage</strong></td>
<td>Archaic language and style found in many ballads; Poetic spoken language, use of similes. Songs contain local colloquialisms and dialect: “To return to her people, she never would no more.”</td>
<td>Archaic language and style found in some ballads; Blunt and plain spoken language. Songs contain local colloquialisms and dialect: “It makes no doubt but you think it strange.”</td>
<td>More archaic language and style retained in southern than northern songs, although it exists in both. Colloquialisms in both.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Racism</strong></td>
<td>Found outright in some songs.</td>
<td>Found outright in some songs.</td>
<td>Did this have an impact upon collecting methods?...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Terrain</strong></td>
<td>Mountainous, rugged.</td>
<td>Mountainous, rugged, harsh winters.</td>
<td>Made for isolated locales which necessitated communal activities like music–making.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bootleg Liquor</td>
<td>Moonshine, Mountain Dew.</td>
<td>Applejack, Catskill Lightning.</td>
<td>Seemed to somehow inspire…song…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Artistic Traditions that Shaped American Culture</strong></td>
<td>Music</td>
<td>Painting – Hudson River School (Thomas Cole, Frederic Church.)</td>
<td>Traditional music in Catskills as well, but it got less notice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Identity</strong></td>
<td>Struggles for a positive identity outside its own area: Stereotype – “Hillbilly”</td>
<td>Struggles for a positive identity outside its own area: Stereotype – “Upstaters”</td>
<td>South does more to create a positive artistic (musical) identity than the Catskills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Will the lack of early Catskill collecting make it difficult to be sure what was there before radio days?

III. Periods of Contact and Likely Musical Transmission

*How: Modes of Transmission:* If the same songs wound up in the Catskill Mountains and the Southern Appalachians, a distance of 900 miles, they had to be transmitted somehow.

The different possible modes of transmission were:

- 1. Simultaneous transmission from a single place to different places (i.e., the British Isles to Virginia/New York).
- 2. Transmission via direct migration from North to South.
- 3. Transmission via direct migration from South to North.
- 4. Transmission via direct migration from South to West.
- 5. Transmission via gathering places encountered during travel.
- 6. Transmission via mutation: mingling of cultures in a static location producing a new cultural phenomenon.
- 8. Transmission via a third central location.
- 9. Transmission via radio, concerts, or recording.

*Transmission: Who Went Where When and Why:*

**Period 1: Immigration mid 1600 – early 1700’s**

The first period of settlement took place with the initial colonization of the coastal areas in the 1600’s and 1700’s. In this initial period, songs from England, Scotland, and Africa traveled simultaneously from the mother countries to Virginia, Massachusetts, and New York. (Williams) *(Transmission mode 1)*
Period Two: Migration mid 1700’s- early 1800’s
In the 1700’s and 1800’s, both Northern and Southern colonies expanded. New Englanders headed west to the Catskills, Catskillians headed west or south, and Southerners headed west into the mountains. Pennsylvania contained the popular road west, as it did not cross into any hostile Native American territory. (Kubik) (Williams)

As people traveled, they crossed paths in taverns along the way. People crossed lines of station and class in these readily, and traded stories and songs. (Frey) (Transmission mode 2,3,5)

Wagon stands, where wagonners stayed, entertained a more raucous kind of behavior and music than the more staid stage houses and taverns. Arthur L. Reist in Conestoga Wagons: Masterpiece of the Blacksmith says that many of their songs were unfit to print. His list of songs sung in crossroads Pennsylvania wagon stands includes seven common to the Catskills and Southern Appalachia, according to our limited study; George Korson in Philadelphia Songs and Legends lists three others. (Reist) (Korson)

In the South, after the Cherokee Nation was exiled west in the 1820’s, a direct route opened into Southern Appalachia from the East Coast. Newly arrived Scottish immigrants, and people from coastal Virginia, North Carolina, and Maryland packed up their things and headed west, bringing their traditions along for the ride. (Williams) (Transmission mode 4) Many Irish and Scots-Irish immigrants came to the Catskills at the same time to work on the Erie Canal, as did a new influx of New Englanders. (Transmission mode 1)

Black people, of course, accompanied these migrations, traveling as slaves with their masters into the mountain regions. As they did on plantations, they used music to keep alive the memory of who they were. A fascinating, and perhaps unique, cultural interchange began between blacks and whites in the Southern Appalachians. Since there was less need for slaves in a land without large plantations, the lines became blurry between whites and blacks in some mountain locations. (Cantwell) In Loyal Jones’s Sound Archives interview with Reverend John Pray, Pastor of Town Mountain Baptist Church in Hazard, Kentucky in 1995, Pray casts light on the subject by explaining that due to the close quarters, isolation, and need for interdependency, people began seeing and treating each other the same regardless of race, living side-by-side and even engaging in common-law marriage. (Reverend John Pray Interview with Loyal Jones)

While this degree of commonality between races may have been unusual in the rest of Appalachia, this story illustrates the close relationships black and white people sometimes had in the mountains. When two peoples live side by side, the intermingling of culture is inevitable, until one can listen to a song and not be certain whether it got its start with People A or People B. This musical intermingling between black and white is an integral part of what we think of as Southern white rural music, aka American folk music. (Transmission mode 6)
This phenomenon occurred in the South, but not the North. The dual reasons: lack of slavery, and living situations. There were no large plantations in the North where large numbers of slaves joined together to find comfort in music. Slavery was abolished in the 1820’s. According to the Gazetteer of the State of NY of 1860, in the census of 1855, few rural counties exceeded 1% black population. (French) (J.H.) Most free black people who stayed in New York opted to live in the cities, bonding together in neighborhoods. Unlike the South, there was little opportunity for the intermingling of black and white rural cultures in the Catskills since there was no black rural culture to begin with. Too few of them were there. Catskill folk music was not informed by African-American music in the crucial formative years of the 1700’s and early 1800’s for one simple reason: there was no possibility that it could be.

Revivals: The Second Great Awakening predicated a cultural movement that facilitated both the transmission of tradition between black and white, and North and South.

Camp meetings, or revivals, were a phenomenon that began in the early 1800’s. The presence of black people, slaves before emancipation, free afterwards, was common at revivals. An unusual feature of revivals was the lack of separation between the races. Everyone sat together. This meant that there were Protestant hymns being learned by African-Americans, and African-Americans lending their musical stylings to revival songs. These stylings no doubt included the hallmarks of African-American music: call and response, refrains, note bending, syncopation and other rhythmic complexity, drive, backbeat, and improvisation. (Reed) (Transmission Mode 6)

Contemporary accounts verify the transmission and fusion of black and white musical styles via revival shows, including that of Philadelphia Methodist Reverend John Watson at the 1801 Cane Ridge, KY revival. White reporter H.V. Synan was still complaining about the influence of African-American music on the Asuza Camp Meeting in Los Angeles in 1906. (Reed)

Camp meetings traveled, and came to be as popular in the North as the South. Revival shows traversed upstate New York in the late 1800’s/early 1900’s, crossing the Catskills as they traveled from Albany to Binghamton. (Douglass) Catskill residents learned the same songs that were being sung at Southern revival shows. Often, these songs began their existences as black spirituals, such as “Old Ship of Zion.” (Transmission Mode 3)

Minstrel Shows: Another form of early 19th century entertainment that originated in the South and traveled North was the minstrel show. Minstrel shows included skits, jokes, song, and dance and routinely included denigrating stereotypes of blacks. However, as my friend and colleague Sparky Rucker likes to point out, the first minstrel shows were actually comprised of all black casts. (W.C. Handy backs him up on this point). (Eileen Southern) Sparky also says that when white people took them over, they became the first venues in America where black and white people performed together as professional musicians.

How did white performers come to play this style of music? Cantwell mentions a host of examples of black musicians teaching and influencing white minstrels, who often appropriated their music without acknowledgement. This is a fact to which the general public was oblivious (and still is). (Cantwell) The presence of the African-banjo in white minstrels serves as a perfect visual representation of white people appropriating African-American music. (Transmission mode 6)
One might be tempted to write this off as simple exploitation of black music. Yet, read the words of Virginia Minstrel Ben Cotton:

“I used to sit with them in front of their cabins, and we would start the banjos twanging and their voices would ring out in the quiet night air in their weird melodies...I was the first white man they had seen who sang as they did...but we were brothers for the time being and were perfectly happy.” (Cantwell)

There is something more than exploitation here, something moving. We see in Cotton’s words the simple, basic impulse that musicians have to connect, human to human, through music. This is true of whites learning black music, blacks learning white music, Southerners learning Northern music, or Northerners learning Southern music. We musicians go where the good tunes are, and we’re grateful for the getting. Yes, minstrelsy spiraled into cruel parodies of blacks. But that is not where it began.

Minstrel shows traveled, and were actually more popular in the North than the South during the late 1800’s. (Bronner) Apparently, they appealed to rural white (racist) sensibilities in the North, too. Some tunes from Minstrel show songs worked their way into the Catskill song and fiddle repertoire. Golden Slippers is probably the most notable example, along with Turkey in the Straw and Arkansas Traveler. (Bronner) They are played there still. (Transmission mode 3)

A word must be said about printed music at this time. Printed songbooks, such as revival books, became available to the public in the early to mid 1800’s. By the mid to late 1800’s, songbooks consisting of an amalgam of patriotic songs, hymns, and revival songs were common and easily obtained. Song lyrics also appeared in newspapers, and some songs, like Dermott Asthore, apparently had their start as poems that were later given melodies. As with broadside ballads, songs were sometimes learned from these printed sources and then passed on via oral tradition. (Gardner) (Transmission Mode 7)

Period 4: The Civil War, 1861-1865

We come to a bloody period of time when North and South tried their best to destroy one another. But we also find this to be a time of musical transmission between the two areas. One must remember that soldiers from the South fought for the North and vice versa. One must also remember that Kentucky and Maryland, which were culturally Southern states, fought for the North. And finally, one must remember that one of the main things that passed the time for soldiers idly awaiting action in camp was music.

What must those camps have been like? One can imagine fiery Southern fiddlers from Kentucky dueling stolid Catskill fiddlers from New York, or Massachusetts fishermen trading shanties for Maryland ballads. One can almost hear the square Northern flat four of St Anne’s Reel in counterpoint with the strong South mountain backbeat and wild notes of Devil’s Dream; the full-throated Northern shape note hymns alternating with Southern banjo tunes; the black Northern soldiers (many escaped slaves) singing spirituals in a tradition familiar to the Kentucky and Marylanders but not to soldiers from Northern states. Anecdotal evidence backs up this kind
of musical exchange, at least on the Northern side. Songs documented as traveling to the Catskill after the Civil War include “The Bright Sunny South,” “The Battle of Gettysburg,” “The Little Octaroon,” and “Nellie Gray.” One could argue that at the very moment the nation was being torn apart, it was also beginning to form a national identity through the establishment of a common body of music. (Norman Cazden) (Gardner) \textit{(Transmission Mode 3, 8, likely 2 as well}).

It should also be noted that by this time, printed music of songs popular during the Civil War was available, as was composed music written in various “folk traditions” (i.e. Stephen Foster). Printed songbooks increased in popularity from that time until the current advent of online music. This helped with the nationwide dissemination of a body of music that, though composed, is now accepted as part of the folk canon.

\textbf{Period 5: Post-War Migration 1870-1910}

The South was left in shambles after the end of the Civil War, leading many people to travel to cities for work. By the 1890’s, this meant forgetting the animosities of the war and traveling north. While many went to cities, others from the mountain states sought work they were accustomed to: logging. Although there was a logging boom in Kentucky in the 1890’s, in the early 1900’s loggers from Kentucky and Tennessee sought work in Michigan lumber camps. (Franzen) At the same time, many people from the Catskills, the hemlock long logged out, traveled to Michigan for work. (Norman Cazden) Once again, we have Southerners and Northerners in a shared environment, with predictable musical results: more cross-culturalization.

There was a strong singing tradition from the Northern Woods. Ballad contests were common in camp for entertainment. (Cox) Mix this with the long Southern Appalachian singing tradition, and we are bound to wind up with a body of shared song. \textit{Ballads and Songs of Southern Michigan} by Emelyn Elizabeth Gardner contains 20 songs found in Michigan lumber camps that were also collected in the Catskills and in Southern Appalachia. Gardner attributes this to a common English heritage. (Gardner, Ballads and Songs of Southern Michigan) But how then do we explain logging songs common to both places like “The Woodsman’s Alphabet” and “The Jam on Gerry’s Rock”? It is more likely that songs sung in lumber camps traveled North or South with returning lumberman. \textit{(Transmission Mode 8)}

\textbf{Period 6: The Age of Radio 1925-1955}

Radio shows featuring traditional mountain music were a feature of both Southern Appalachian and Catskill locales. While it is undeniable that national shows like The Barn Dance from WLS radio in Chicago (which in began April, 1924) impacted Catskill musicians, it is also true that old-time Catskill fiddlers were on local airwaves even earlier.

John McDermott, a Catskill fiddler who was the New York State Champion many times over, played on WFBI radio in Syracuse in January, 1924 (predating the Barn Dance by four months). His first recording, in 1926, included tunes also found in the south, such as the “Virginia Reel and” Mrs. McCloud’s Reel” (“Uncle Joe” in the South). (Bronner)

It is important to acknowledge the presence of McDermott on radio before the Barn Dance went on air. It is a perception that the Catskill Mountains had no folk tradition of their own, that their only traditional music was imported from the South during the
1900’s. We have seen a long anecdotal history to the contrary. With McDermott’s radio performance in 1924, we have a concrete example.

It was later on during the age of radio that Southern songs and Southern musical styling, began to work their way into the Catskill repertoire largely because of one man: Berea College’s own Bradley Kincaid.

Kincaid was born in 1884 near Paint Lick, Kentucky. Kincaid’s archive at Berea details a rags-to-riches story. He is best known as a singer on WLS radio’s famous “Barn Dance” show starting in 1925. It is impossible to overestimate Kincaid’s popularity and what kind of impact he and the Barn Dance had on the fame of Southern music. The fan mail to Kincaid found in the Berea archives is fawning, worshipful, and plentiful – over 100,000 pieces a year in its heyday. His first recording in 1928 sold 20 million copies. He published a series of songbooks of traditional folksongs, which sold over 250,000 copies. In a 1931 concert, he received top billing over Douglas Fairbanks. He had fans everywhere that WLS broadcasts went, including places with syndication, and this included the Catskill Mountains. (Archives, Kincaid Collection)

It is odd to note that Kincaid had a bigger effect on the Catskills than either the Carter Family or Bill Monroe, both of whom were at their height at this time, and both of whom were even better known nationally. No sources in any Catskill collection mention them as an influence. There is a reason for that. Kincaid had more direct contact with the Catskills and its people because he worked at WGY in Schenectady, NY and at WHAM in Binghamton, NY. He used Syracuse as a home broadcasting base for close to ten years, and actually lived in Long Island and in New York City while doing so. (Not many people seem to know this, but then, it’s not exactly a good public image for a Southern Appalachian singer.) During that time, he toured upstate New York, as evidenced by contracts in the Kincaid archives. (Archives, Kincaid Collection)

People of the Catskills found that Kincaid’s music resonated with them. He had many Catskill fans. He also had a lasting influence on Catskill musicians. “I liked to sit and listen to good ballad singers like Bradley Kincaid,” said Catskill fiddler and songmaker Grant Rogers. “He had a line of good stuff that we played.” Rogers had plenty to go on already; born in 1907, he started playing the fiddle young and said, “The tunes were all over the Catskills.” (Bronner) Rogers found fame of his own later on radio as a fiddler and as a writer of songs in the Catskill tradition, tinged with Southern influence, a la Kincaid.

Another direct Catskill link to Kincaid was George “Gib” Bourne. Bourne toured in 1942 with Bradley Kincaid. Kincaid was comfortable with Bourne’s Catskill music, finding its roots related to the style of song he knew. (Bronner) It is important to note that Bourne was drawing on Catskill roots, not Southern at this time. A Catskill musical tradition was and had been firmly in place for many years.

While touring New York, Kincaid often used local upstate performers as opening acts, a practice common in coffee houses to this day. The question arises at this point as to whether any musical migration was strictly from Kincaid outwards, or whether the funnel worked both ways. According to WHAM, Kincaid was searching out “the mountain regions of our eastern seabord” for songs. This may largely be P.R. on the part of WHAM. (Bronner) Yet we know that Kincaid was granted permission by at least one Catskill songwriter to record a song: Paul Floyd Cornish, from Schoharie, NY, in 1944. (Archives, Kincaid Collection)
Kincaid would sometimes dress in hayseed outfits at performances. At least one fan wrote a letter expressing her distress at this, stating that listening to Kincaid’s music had always made her proud of being from Kentucky, and he had made her ashamed. Kincaid wrote back and apologized. (Archives, Kincaid Collection)

Kincaid was sometimes called a hillbilly in press releases. Despite his use of costume, he objected to this nomenclature rather strongly, although it seems his objection is to the musical rather than cultural connotation. He derides hillbilly music as “a bit rowdy and shady, written on short notice primarily for commercial purposes.” He compares them to Kentucky ballads: “Kentucky ballads are different. They have a charm and dignity all their own.” In a letter to Mr. H.E. Taylor in Berea, Kincaid says “…I sing only the typical Folk Songs of the mountains. That is the thing on which I shall have to sell the powers that be. I honestly believe that I could go into any theatre in New York and be well received, if properly advertised.” (Archives, Kincaid Collection)

Perhaps so. But by 1950, Kincaid found his star waning. One letter from a fan wistfully asks, “I wonder if you still sing the old ballads and play the Hound Dog guitar.” A telegram from a venue operator says flatly, “Cannot use Kincaid under any circumstances.” His time is the limelight over, Kincaid mostly retired from performing and opened a music store in Springfield, Ohio, over which he presided until his death in 1989 at age 94. (Archives, Kincaid Collection) One of his later appearances was at the first Berea College Celebration of Traditional Music in 1974.

Meanwhile, in the Catskills, performers embraced the “hillbilly” label. Groups like Floyd Woodhull’s Old Tyme Masters, the Woodchoppers and the Hornellsville Hillbillies happily donned the hillbilly look, played in towns and cities and on radio, and enjoyed their fame. They embraced the term and did not see in it anything derogatory. Of course, they did not see it in a “Southern” hillbilly context:

“Oh, no, no, no. Of course I have the utmost respect for the South, don’t get me wrong, but I think it was a hillbilly, the hills of this area and that was the image. It was a farmer’s image, or a hillbilly image but not a hillbilly like you connect with moonshiners like you say Tennnessee or something like that. It’s not that type.” – Floyd Woodhull  (Bronner)

The “hillbilly” moniker can start a fight in the South, though strangely enough, the origins of the word were not derogatory. “Hillbillie” comes from the Scottish term for “hill folk;” the word “billie” is a Scottish colloquialism that means “fellow, companion, comrade, mate.” (Bronner) Given the ethnic makeup of both the Catskills and the Southern Appalachians, this seems the most probable origin.

The first time the word “hillbilly” was used to describe a piece of music was when Uncle Dave Macon recorded “Hillbilly Blues” in 1924. In 1925, an old-time quartet recorded in New York City for Okeh Records. They had no name, and the group’s leader, Al Hopkins, said, “We’re nothing but a bunch of hillbillies from North Carolina and Virginia...Call us anything.” The record was put out with the group listed as “The Hillbillies,” and the group began touring in hillbilly outfits, presenting a full show that included
Vaudeville-like funny bits. In the blink of an eye, there were a half-dozen groups sporting the word “Hillbilly” in their titles, and “hillbilly music” was born as a genre in the eyes of the record industry. (Bronner)

Call it what you will: Appalachian, rustic, Catskill, hillbilly – the music was hugely popular for about twenty years. It was predictably popular in rural areas. But as Nate McGhee pointed out in his Berea Sound Archives Fellowship oral report, an unexpected result of shows like the Barn Dance was that people in urban areas became fans of these programs. He postulates that it is because many listeners had migrated from the Southern Appalachian countryside, and the music connected them to their homes. (McGhee) This was true in the North as well as the South; many Catskillians moved to Northern cities for work, and they found the music appealing. (Bronner) Rural white music, North or South, now had a mixed audience of rural residents, urban dwellers who were migrants from the country, and urban dwellers who enjoyed feeling superior to their country hick neighbors. The fact that there is a meanness to this last cannot be overlooked, and is in fact probably part of what makes Southerners sensitive to the hillbilly label. Laughing at rural Southerners had become big business, a business that carried past the end of radio and into the days of the television show Hee Haw. No such national stage of ridicule had been established for Catskill hillbillies; it was always Catskillians laughing at themselves for Catskill audiences. In other words, it was all in the family, so no offense came to be taken at the name.

If Bradley Kincaid was allergic to the term “hillbilly,” the later Catskill musicians were allergic to the term “country and western.” They felt that the old-timey style of music was getting squeezed out by the more successful (after World War II) country and western genre. Hillbilly was out. Hank Williams was in. Grant Rogers complained in 1987, “They call it country and western, but I don’t see where they get any western out of it....You hear one, you hear them all.” (Bronner) Not everyone objected, however. Some musicians embraced the new trend, like Charley Hughes. Hughes worshipped Hank Williams, and in 1953, joined the Rhythm Rangers, a group that played Hank Williams songs mixed in with fiddle tunes. In 1957, Hughes formed the Westernaires, a band that played every Saturday night at the Bell Hotel in Schenevus, NY. The group featured hot fiddle solos by Hughes, which had become standard fare for the country and western genre. (Bronner) The popularity of this genre in the Catskills lingers still.

One other thing of note happened during this time in the Catskills: Camp Woodland was founded in 1941. Woodland was a camp for city children run by educator Norman Studer. Studer sent the campers out into the local community to collect songs from older residents. They put on festivals every year featuring some of those residents including George Edwards and Grant Rogers. Camp Woodland lasted into the 1960’s, and the resulting collection, “Folk Songs of the Catskills” is at a whopping 650 pages one of the few great testaments to the Catskill musical tradition. (Norman Cazden)

**Period 7: 1955 – present**

Traditional bands and singers lost their large audiences in the Catskills, but the music was kept alive on a grass-roots level. People continued playing it at home and at small concerts and dances. As Northern traditional music had never had the presence in the recording industry that Southern music had, Catskillians kept doing with music what they always had: Played it, sang it, made it up, danced to it, and listened to it.

Camp Woodland continued through the 1960’s, when the insidious workings of the McCarthy years finally took its toll on the Norman Studer. The man was simply too far ahead of his time. A progressive, pro-union New York educator who believed in cultural and racial integration, and one who stated that he hoped that places like Camp Woodland could help bring all Americans
together through a common folk musical identity, he was a prime target for HUAC. Studer was brought before HUAC from 1954-58 and accused of having sympathetic ties with the Communist Party, subversively training and indoctrinating children, and claimed he "purposely hired Communists as his assistants at the camp" (aka, Pete Seeger). Perhaps that is one the biggest differences between Southern music and Northern music during this period. In the South, people fostering traditional arts were respected and even revered. In the North, they were tried. The Board of Directors fell over each other trying to run away, the camp was burned, and Camp Woodland was over. It looked like interest in Catskill music as a whole was over. (Collection)

In the 1980’s, however, several things happened.

First, Herbert Haufrecht completed and oversaw the publication of *Folk Songs of the Catskills*, the written monument to decades of song collecting at Camp Woodland. Studer, sadly, died in 1978, and Cazden died two years later, leaving Haufrecht to finish and publish the massive work. The book was published in 1982. (Norman Cazden)

Second, there was a new surge of interest in “North Country” music, and it came from urban dwellers who came back to the country. Dick Thompson, a musician in Central New York, said, “They seem to be going back to the old time tunes, the old time sound…I think they’re trying to reach for something that they think people years ago had that they don’t have, a contentment that they can’t find with all the modern stuff.” (Bronner) Several festivals featuring Catskill music, and folk music, were begun, with the Old Songs Festival in Guilderland (actually Altamont), NY as the queen of them all. Old Songs sported the best of folk stage acts and dance bands. (Having played it three times, once as a backup musician, once in a dance band, and once as a feature act, I am glad to report that it is still going strong in its 32nd year.) The Clearwater Great Revival Festival, sponsored by Pete Seeger’s Hudson River Sloop Clearwater, is in its 34th year. The Ashokan Festival, started by fiddler Jay Ungar (composer of Ashokan Farewell) holds weeklong song and dance camps. Contra dances still take place across the region, though the dancers are fewer, slower and greyer these days. Coffee houses and folk series can still be found, including the Eighth Step in Albany, the Kortright Center in Stamford and Six on the Square in Oxford. These tend to feature national acts, though; it is almost as though venue operators are ignorant of the long local tradition of Catskill music.

Most Catskill residents today are fans of modern country music, which maintains the structures and harmonies of traditional music but has become formulaic, religiously simplistic, and jingoistic. But then, so have the Catskills. It is a land that fortune has not favored for a hundred years. Farmers pay more to produce a gallon of milk than they make selling it, and many are losing their land. They turn to the simplest form of music that is being produced today, one that talks of rural life and the rather cut and dried values they hold in a positive way. But then the culture of the Catskills has never been one of subtleties. It is a hard country inhabited by blunt people. But it is also a place where a person will walk a mile to dig his neighbor’s car out of the snow, even if he can’t stand him, because “that’s how we do things here.” Catskillians still have the tenacity to make a life where the winters are harsh and the monetary benefits few, because of the beauty of the mountains, because many families have long-standing attachments to their land, because this is where they belong. To many, it is and always will be home, and that is an attachment that runs deep.

As for the South, country music succeeded folk, and bluegrass succeeded country, and country and western succeeded bluegrass, and modern country succeeded country and western. So the progression continues. Despite this, southern traditional music has never completely gone out of style. Since the first definitions of “American folk music,” Americans have looked south, and we look
School children nationwide have learned to square dance to southern tunes for decades; they still do. Most folksongs in public school general music books hail from the South. Southern traditional music gets an additional occasional boost from movies like “Songcatcher” and “Oh Brother, Where Art Thou?”, reminding the general public of the existence and history of this long and rich tradition of music. And so they should. But if there is one final point I would make, it is this: American folk music is comprised of many musics and many influences, because so are we as a people. What we think of as “folk” has many more branches than those that initially spring to mind, and each influences the others. It is all “our” music, and we are worth more than a superficial understanding. Perhaps by examining the contributions all groups have made, without bias, we can come to a better understanding of who we were, and are, as a people.

In that spirit, let us examine the musics of our two areas of interest.

IV – The Music

Introduction: The Collectors

It helps to know a little bit about our sources.

In New York

Louis C. Jones was a founder of the New York Folklore Society. He instituted a project through the University of Albany to collect Catskill folk music in the 1940’s-70’s.

Norma Studer, Norman Cazden, Herbert Haufrecht were the forces behind Camp Woodland and the Camp Woodland Collection.

Hartwick College Library, Oneonta: sound field recordings

First Methodist Church in Oneonta: old hymnals and revival books including “The Finest of the Wheat.”

“The Depth of the Well”: An oral history conducted by Cherry Valley- Springfield High School students (supervised by me)

In Kentucky, we had the amazing Hutchins Library Sound Archives at Berea College available to us, and studied the following:

Major sound collections:

Bradley Kincaid. A famous singing star on radio in the 1930’s in Kentucky and the Catskills, and nationwide.
Early Celebration of Traditional Music recordings that included the Ritchie Family, the Mosers, Addie Graham, and Jim and Doug Trentham.

Asa Martin and Doc Roberts recordings. Asa Martin was a singer and guitarist, Doc Roberts a fiddler. They recorded in the 20’s and 30’s. One of the first to sound “country.”

Barbara Kunkle’s interview with Addie Graham. Addie Graham was The Real Thing, a mountain woman with a repertoire of songs that reflected her life, place, and influences.

Barbara Kunkle’s interview with Mary Lozier. Another woman with a trunk full of songs.

Loyal Jones’s interview with Reverend John Pray and Vance and Eileen McClain Blair about the mixed race town of Hazard, KY.

Written collections included Kincaid and the following:

John F. Smith Collection, 1915: Smith taught at Berea and told his students, “Bring me the songs your family sings.” He put together a huge collection of these songs, the Berea Tune List.

Katherine Jackson French Collection: French hailed from London, Kentucky. She was the first woman south of the Mason-Dixon line to attend Harvard University. She taught at Bryn Mawr and Holyoke, but she never lost her interest in the ways of her home. She compiled a volume of ballads that was never published, though she tried mightily to enlist the help of Berea College in 1910 to do so.

Josiah Combs Collection: Josiah Combs was a collector of Southern Appalachian folksongs in the early 1900’s. Like many early collectors, he had his agenda, which was to prove that the heritage of Southern Appalachia was English, and therefore its people superior to black people and recent immigrants. He was, however, a great lover of the ballad, and put together a collection to rival Sharp’s. His 1925 PhD dissertation at the Sorbonne, Folk Songs of the Southern United States (Folk Songs du Midi de Etats Uni) was one of our major sources for this project. We used both the manuscript and printed versions; many songs were omitted from the printed version due, according to editor Laws, to not being permitted to print any song that had already appeared in print. We also used all the other songs in manuscript in the collection.

Bradley Kincaid Collection: Kincaid amassed a huge collection of folksongs, and published some of them in songbooks. We used the book and his manuscript collection, plus correspondence. (Kubik, The Story of the Susquehanna Turnpike)

We also availed ourselves of published works, in particular, the excellent Folk Songs of the Catskills by Norman Cazden, Herbert Haufrecht, and Norman Studer, and collections by Emelyn Elizabeth Gardner, Cecil Sharp and Olive Campbell, and John Harrington Cox.
Part One:

Lyrics

In comparing the musics of the two areas, we found a large crossover of songs regarding lyrical texts. **Drawing only on materials found in materials studied in the Berea Archives** (and realizing that this in no way comprises a complete study of Appalachian music) and comparing them to archival and published collections from the Catskills, we arrive at the following list of 57 songs common to the Catskills and Southern Appalachia, based on lyrical content.

**Graph One: Songs in Common and Degree of Similarity, Catskill Mountains and Southern Appalachia**

On a scale of 1-5, with 5 being the highest, here is our key to the levels of similarity between the Southern Appalachian and Catskill songs regarding lyrics:

5 – Identical scansion, rhyme scheme, key rhymes, same verses, occasional misplacing of words or verses. Most verses the same. Parallel verses the same. May have more or less verses version to version.

4 - Identical scansion, rhyme scheme, at least 1/2 verses the same, occasional misplacing of words or verses. May have more or less verses version to version.

3 - Identical scansion, rhyme scheme, at least 1/3 verses the same, occasional misplacing of words or verses. May have more or less verses version to version.

2 – Same story, different rhyme scheme and scansion. Only ¼ verses or less the same.

1 – Story is the same, no verses in common.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Southern Appalachian Title</th>
<th>Southern Appalachian Source</th>
<th>Catskill Title</th>
<th>Catskill Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abdullah Bul-Bul Ameer</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid, ms</td>
<td>Sons of the Prophets</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Artist</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amazing Grace</td>
<td>Josiah Combs</td>
<td>FSDS Primitive Baptist tune</td>
<td>Amazing grace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas Traveler</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid; Asa Martin rec list</td>
<td>Arkansaas Traveler</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (Emmett Bryden, Aaron Van de Bogart Sr.); NC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awake, Awake, You Drowsy Sleepers (Wake Up CTM both), Silver Dagger</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Awake, Awake, Ye Drowsy Sleepers</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards; Marvin Yale)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BTL (Awake), Betty Smith</td>
<td>CTM 2012</td>
<td>Sharp collected;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ballad of Jesse James, Jesse James  Josiah Combs  Ballad of Jesse James, The  NC (mention)

BBB has Jersey City, same song transplanted. Ballad of the famous outlaw. No texts in archives for comparison.

/B
No archival Southern source.

Banks of the Sweet Dundee, The (Maid JC2)  Josiah Combs  Banks of Sweet Dundee, The; Farmer's Daughter, The  FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); BBB

A cheery story of an attempted rape and triple homicide. No copy from archive, just Sharp and Cox and Michigan. Laws mentions, M 25 5 Childs 84.

Barbara Allen  Josiah Combs  Barbara Allen, BARBRY ALLEN (traditional)

The only ballad in the world that has its own Facebook page, this may well be thought of as a quintessential Southern ballad. It tells the tale of a cold-hearted young woman who will not go to see a dying lad, and then repents of it.

It may be descended from an older' ballad; Thompson thinks it is
the woman’s version of Lord Lovell (Childs 75). The lover’s knot at end is certainly borrowed from Childs ballad Lord Lovell (or possibly Lass of Roch Royal).

5
Sad tale of buddies at the Battle of Gettysburg. Both die. It is not clear whether they are Northern or Southern soldiers, which might have been part of the point of the song.

Verses are the same, Catskill version is shorter.

This is an American version of Lord Randall (Childs 12), and a cheery one. Nobody dies from being poisoned. No one even gets a stomach ache. Kitteridge thinks it’s British (but he thought EVERYTHING was British) and Sharp thinks it’s an Appalachian comic takeoff on Lord Randall.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bonaparte's Retreat</td>
<td>BTL</td>
<td>BK identical to LCJ but LCJ has no “sweetened pone” verse and is shorter. Same with FSH give or take a verse. No tune given for Northern Catskill. Fiddle tune.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
<td>No Catskill version available. Character is clearly southern fiddle: open fiddle fifths all over the place which are an intrinsic part of the tune. Tune probably stems from an earlier Irish tune.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Boston Burglar       | BTL; Josiah Combs FSD | BTL identical to FSOC/BTL; Josiah Combs FSD ms  
|                      | Boston Burglar, The |  
|                      | FSOC/CWC (Celia Kelder); LCJ |  
|                      | BBB            |  
| Brave Wolf           | Battle of Montcalm and Wolf | He and Montcalm are |

5 Sad tale of a boy who is caught as a burglar and sent to jail. Based on Botany Bay.
both killed on the Plains of Abraham.

Same story, totally different songs. Story of a girl who loves well but not wisely. She falls in love with the butcher boy, is disgraced, and hangs herself.

Grant Rogers’ version: Very similar to Kincaid. Common verses are identical. In major key; adds a mother verse and dialog verse; father comes home, breaks down door, and finds she’s hung herself; cuts her down, finds note, which reads: “A silly girl I am, that you know, to hang myself for the butcher boy” and “Must I go bound while he goes free; must I love a boy who doesn’t love me.”

Kincaid’s is shorter, only five verses.

Trentham’s version is major. Verse “wishing I was a maid again.”
She’s pregnant. She goes upstairs, asks for a chair from mom and pen and ink. What a foolish girl was I to be led astray by a butcher boy. Dad breaks door, same verse as Catskill. “Make my bed long wide and deep. Pretty much same last verse.

Laws 2 says there’s a broadside, which was “Jersey City”

5
The old ballad whereby lovers request impossible things of each other before the other “will be a true lover of mine.”

Moser and Edwards words almost identical.

4
Kitteridge’s version is a 4, nearly the same, uses a similar refrain: Every rose grows merry in time/O me rose, be married in time.

Cambric Shirt Joanne Moser
CTM 1974; Kitteridge, JAFI (in Kincaid) (ev rose merry in time) Petticoat Lane; Cambric Shirt FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); BBB

4 BBB is entirely in
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Captain Jinks</td>
<td>Josiah Combs</td>
<td>FSD</td>
<td>Uses a nonsense refrain. A silly song about a captain in the horse marines who lives the high life and has an eye for the ladies. No archival Southern version for comparison. / Fiddle tune.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicken Reel</td>
<td>Asa Martin rec</td>
<td>OTMM</td>
<td>Southern fiddle tune. Doesn't work without the bent notes (more on that later) No archival southern version available for comparison. 5 Fun song about how wonderful this young man's love, Cindy, is.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cindy</td>
<td>BTL, Bradley Kincaid ms</td>
<td>NC</td>
<td>Same, one verse and one chorus only in Catskill version. 4 Childs Ballad. Story of a girl who's kidnapped and taken to sea.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Laws says it was a broadside.

Edwards’ version has the girl’s true love as a house carpenter.

Long version in the Catskills.

Combs equates it with Pretty Polly.

Cuckoo Is a a Pretty Bird, The; Cuckoo
Bradley Kincaid sb; BTL A-Walkin’ and A-Talkin’ FSOC/CWC (George Edwards)

Wistful love song with a long perspective on the ups and downs of love.

Identical verses just less than half; southern version has more verses.

Childs Ballad 20.

This has many incarnations. In general, the lyrical form is always line, refrain,
line, refrain. Both are obviously variants of the Childs ballad and tell the same grizzly tale, though Yale’s version has lost the setup verses.

British broadside published 1638 according to Cazden.

Betty Smith’s version used the refrain, “Down in the green woods of ivy.” All the others I’ve heard have variants of “Down by the greenwood sidey-oh.”

French and Yale: 3 verses the same, Southern Appalachian version starts in the middle of the story and doesn’t tell the first part of the story. Catskill does.

4 Silly song about the virtues on someone’s ram.

| Darby Ram | BTL; Josiah Combs mention FSD | Darby Ram, The FSOC/CWC (Mike Todd); NC (mention) | BTL has two versions clipped from |
newspapers. The second has 3 verses identical to Catskill version. They pick different parts of the ram to fib about, and the Catskill version includes two profanities.
Combs only has 2 verses, wool and horn.

Sentimental song about an old black man who has lost his wife and is about to die.

Close to identical versions.

Song about the assassination of a local leader in Kentucky.
Take-off on Jesse James.

Uses the scansion and the tune of Jesse James, both Martin and Graham. It’s a takeoff.

Northern Catskill source could only recall chorus of Jesse James, which is the same melody and much the same words as Addie Graham’s song about
Markum.

4
Childs 278

Comic. The Devil takes a farmer’s wife to Hell. She tears the place up and he sends her back.

Ritchie’s version has three additional verses at the end, including a punchline (“Oh, women they are so much better than men/When they get sent to Hell, they get sent back again!”).

Catskill has more profanity. Ritchie’s has a few more little devils that she wallops.

Combs p 67 says that it’s a Child ballad.

According to Cazden, goes back to a 1630 broadside, “How the divell was guld by a scould” (Roxburghe).

Same story
Ritchie/Yale.

Same scansion on
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Devil’s Dream</td>
<td>BTL</td>
<td>Devil’s Dream</td>
<td>OTNN, Fiddle tune. No archival Southern source for comparison, but today’s Devil Dream is the same in both places. Song about someone missing his lover. In some versions, he’s in jail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Down in the Valley</td>
<td>Bradley</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
<td>No Catskill source.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Dying Californian, The | Bradley  | FSOC/CWC (George Edwards) | About a man dying on a ship en route to California. Asks his shipmate (brother) to bid farewell to his loved ones verse by verse. Identical versions; order of verses slightly juggled. I found no other Southern versions other than Kincaid. Catskill version has the more artistic ending: “Hark! I hear the Saviour calling/Tis his
voice, I know it
well/When I’m gone,
oh, don’t be weeping;
Brother, here’s my last
farewell.”
/
No southern source but
likely the same tune (it
is today).
5

Foggy Dew, The
Bradley
Kincaid, rec;
Josiah Combs
Foggy Foggy Dew,
Foggy Dew
FSOC/CWC (George
Edwards); SOC; NC

Love song.

Kincaid’s version is very
much like Edwards.
Even the melody is a
close match.

Kincaid’s has 1 more
verse. Early recording,
and it’s very Irish tenor,
sung with harp.
McCormack/Olcott,
parlor singing.
Fermatas on high
notes, sung beautifully,
clear, high placement.
Slightly different words
verse one. Same tune,
B starts just a touch
diff.

Combs p 183 says it’s
the Bugaboo, which
bears no relation
whatsoever.
It's basically the same story, of two mismatched animals, a frog and a mouse. Mouse dies in most of them.

Refrains different on all of these, but it's the same song and story.

Combs:
NC:
"Sing a song, Katie won't you kie me oh/"
than "Kemoh kemoh Kie moh Kie Way down yonder in a hollow tree Bat an the bear and the bumble bee/ Sings a song Katie won't you Kie Me Oh!" (that refrain from a printed Christie Minstrel version)

Yale refrain:
"Fie-iddle-o-day. All different nonsense

SOC is "Ay Oh says Rowley oh."

Froggie Went a-Courting, Frog's Courtship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bradley</th>
<th>Froggie Went a-Courtin' AOCourtin; A Frog, He Would a-Wooing Go (SOC), same; Missie Mouse NC; FSOC/CWC (Marvin Yale); SOC rec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kincaid sb, rec 1928, rec; Josiah Combs FSD w/dif tune</td>
<td>Mouse dies after wedding because she has to swim to the honeymoon with frog.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Verses vary. Catskill version suggests Rat and Mouse get eaten. 5
The old pipe tune.

There’s a different song to this title, but the old Revolutionary era tune remains in the fiddle rep up north. Mary Lozier sang it exactly the same.

/ No archival Southern source)

Psuedo-spiritual about how much better Heaven will be than earthly life.

Listed in BTL; played on field recordings for NC and HFR; transcribed in OTMM.

This was written about the War of 1812, The Battle of New Orleans.

Fiddle tune.

Mary Lozier has put two different sets of
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Gave My Love a Cherry</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid (index)</td>
<td>I Gave My Love a Cherry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jam at Gerry's Rock</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Jam at Gerry's Rock; Jam on Gerrion's Rock (Warner); Jam on Jerry's Rock (LJC and OTMM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards, Elston Von Wagner, Dick Edwards); Warner; LCI; OTMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Henry</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French</td>
<td>John Henry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FBC, ms</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Brian O’Linn

words to it here, illustrating the utilitarian view folksingers took of tunes (i.e., “It goes good with that one!”)

Identical

Riddle Song, about accomplishing impossible tasks for the singer’s lover.

No Southern archival version.

Story of a young man who dies trying to break up a logjam.

COMBS mentions only, donated by Cary Woofter 1924. P 209

No Northern Catskill source.

Here is a song so undeniably of African-American origin that even Combs thinks so. The familiar story of the valiant worker who beats the machine even at the cost of his own life is based on a real-life occurrence at the
Big Bend Tunnel in West Virginia.

4, for what's there.

Content: Man receives letter from father saying his mother is dead.

Ken Kane plays it, just sings the verse about opening the letter. Uses only one verse that Kincaid sings, and remembered his dad sang the “broke the seal” line.

4

Childs 75

Story of a man who goes away and while he’s gone, his love dies.

SOC Catskill version longer than BTL: BTL makes no sense, he leaves, gets to London (other is Liverpool) and Nancy is there dead. French is also missing the verses where he is going far and wide seeking silver and gold. But FSOC has no rose and briar verse. BBB does, and the SA
The “Where have you been, Lord Randall my son” series of questions mother asks son.

LCJ starts with what did you eat. Then leave: mother, gold and silver; father, mules and wagon; sister, land and horses; brother, trunks and clothing; sweetheart, hell and fire.

KJF starts with Where have you been. Leaves father “nothing but a dead son to bury”; mother gets land and fine houses; brother bridle and saddle; sister, trunk full of money; sweetheart, a rope and gallows.

Content: A young woman is about to be
hanged, and none of her family will help her. Her sweetheart comes to set her free.

BBB sweetheart doesn’t bring gold but sets her free.

Remarkably consistent between versions, but it is a simple form and easy to remember.

A valiant cabin boy volunteers to dive into the ocean and sink their enemy Turkish ship. The captain double-crosses him and won’t let him back on board. The lad drowns.

KJF virtually identical.
Catskill: Lonesome sea instead of SA lowland low. SA: Mary Golden Tree instead of Catskill Bold Trellitree and SA: Turkey Degree instead of Turkish Revele.

Mary Golden Tree, The; Turkish Revele or Lowlands Low(KJF)(also lists Green Willow Tree and Golden Vanitee) BTL; KJ French ms Bradley Kincaid ms, rec; CTM 1974; Bold Trellitree, The FFSOC/CWC (George Edwards) Madam, I Have Gold and Silver FSOC recording (Barbara Moncure) Story of a maid who
just can't say yes. So he finally asks her a question whereby her no means yes.

Kincaids: normal start for 2 verses; give you jewels, make you rich and free, silken dresses; cruel, let me go; live single all your life?

Kincaid’s No Sir No is the same idea, different verses. BTL is same idea as Kincaid; cons her into agreeing by asking appropriate no questions.

CTM Kincaid performance: “In her arms is a world of pleasure.” Very rubato.

SOC Moncure is a dialog of verses of why she won’t marry an old man. This version from a diary of a Saugerties Schoolgirl 1873.

Song about an eccentric old man

Verses vary place to place.
place. Kincaid used to collect them. Clearly same song, same rhyme scheme and scansion. / Spiritual.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Old Ship of Zion</td>
<td>BTL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ship of Zion</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (Aaron Van de Bogart, Sr.); LCJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No archival Southern source.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Story of a man who loves and Indian lass.

Combs/BBB: Same general story, coconuts in both, Catskill longer than Combs, has a goodbye., Same general key rhymes, verse content.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretty Mohee, Maumee, Little Mohee</td>
<td>BTL; Josiah Combs JAFL Lass of Mohee BBB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Story of a lass who is killed at sea. (Different from the Pretty Polly where she takes a walk before her wedding and he kills her.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretty Polly</td>
<td>KJ French FBC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pretty Polly FSH</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Southern versions all generally the same; Combs crossed out choruses in the second type of Polly songs. I think it was because he had decided Anglo
songs didn’t have them, so they couldn’t really be there.

FSH has a totally different story; like the published Combs, there’s a sea captain.

McClains sing similar to Combs 2.

KJF combines the two; there’s a sea captain and a murder. She throws him overboard, learning his killed 6 already (The Six King’s Daughters, Lady Isabel...All probably descended from that)

Pretty Sarah (Saro) | BTL; Josiah Combs FSDSU | Pretty Saro | LCJ
Bradley Kincaid ms, rec 1928, rec; Asa Martin rec;

Red River Valley | BTL | Red River Valley | NC (mention)

5
Immigrant’s story, and lost love.

LCJ and Combs is identical; Combs has more verses.

5
Song about missing a place.

Kincaid, unusual verse: “And the dark maiden’s
prayer for her lover/To
the Spirit that rules o’er
the world/”May his
pathway be ever in
sunshine”/Is the prayer
of that Red River girl.”

Perhaps this verse
suggests that in this
version at least, red
signifies Native
American.

1 Martin: Only one
verse similar a little

Only a NC mention
/Unknown lyrics north.

Red Wing
- BTL with
  words; Josiah
  Combs FSDSU
  Red Wing
  NC; FFR (Chubb
  McClean)

Red Wing
- BTL Indian Maid words.
  McClain plays a tune
  that fits the scansion of
  BTL lyrics

5
Story: Soldier keeps
coming up with excuses
not to marry, due to
lack of articles of
apparel.

Identical, different
tunes though.
/

Soldier, Soldier,
Will You Marry
Me?
- Bradley
  Kincaid ms, sb
  Soldier, Soldier,
  Will You Marry
  Me?
  FSOC recording; NC
  (mention)

Identical, different
tunes though.
/

No archival Southern
source. This tune today
is the same in both
areas.

Soldier’s Joy
- BTL; Josiah
  Combs
  mention FSD
  Soldier’s Joy
  OTMM; NC; HFR
  (William Powers);
  OTMM

Soldier’s Joy
- OTMM
  Soldier’s Joy
  OTMM
1 Story of a lad in Springfield who dies from a poisonous snakebite.

Combs has only 2 lines per verse, same story. Warner is in a minor key.

Laws says Timothy Myrick of Wilbraham Mass, got bit in Farmington CT, Aug 3, 1761...There were Curtis and Myrick families in the area...Laws says composed locally soon after event. Laws says “This may be the oldest of native ballads now current to have originated with the folk.” Laws claims it to be “one of the few Revolutionary War era ballads we have.”

Combs condescendingly admits it’s from New England:

/Story of a lad who travels to Texas to fight Indians.
The Wealthy Merchant of London

KJ French ms

The Rich Merchant

BBB; FSOC/CWC (George Edwards)

No archival Southern source.

1 Similar story, different rhyme scheme and scansion. She plans to go abroad dressed as a man in Catskill, actually does so in SA; dies in both; in Catskill version by her father's hand, mistaking her to be Willie, in the other by her lover's hand by mistaken identity.

5 Kincaid has some of the Catskill verses

French four verses the same, includes Spain and Turtle Dove. She and Kincaid include “Who will shoe your pretty little foot?”, which is not found in the Catskill version, (the line is descended from Lass of Roch Royal)

Combs has night turning to day, black crows to white, 10,000 miles.

We have the ubiquitous
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Recording Details</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Turkey in the Straw (tune)</td>
<td>Asa Martin, recording 1932; BT; Josiah Combs mention FSD</td>
<td>Turkey in the Straw</td>
<td>OTMM; NC (mention); HFR (William Powers); OTMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Sisters (Lord of the Old Country FBC)</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid sb, rec 1928; Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French FBC, ms</td>
<td>Two Sisters, Twa Sisters</td>
<td>BBB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayfaring Pilgrim</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid (index)</td>
<td>Poor and Foreign Stranger; Poor Unworthy</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); LCJ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Turtle dove, the burning seas, the crow turning white. In all versions.

No archival Southern sources

5

Two sisters love the same man. He favors the younger sister, so the older kills the younger.

Both southern agree;
Miller gets blamed and hung in both, it’s his sister in one.

In BBB, miller fishes out the youngest daughter and marries her.

Studer strongly makes a case for black authorship on this one.

Poor and Foreign Stranger; Poor Unworthy attribute attests to that (mother, father, Saviour).
Key:

Southern Appalachian:
FSD= Folk Songs of the Southern United States (Folk Songs du Midi de Etats Uni) (Josiah Combs) (Combs)
BTL=Berea Tune List (John F. Smith, 1915) (Smith)
FBC=A Fortnight in Ballad Country (Katherine Jackson French) (French)
BK=Barbara Kunkel
KJ French = Katherine Jackson French
JAFL=Journal of American Folklore
CTM=Celebration of Traditional Music (1974 and 1975)
Ms= manuscript
Rec=recording
SB=songbook
SA=Southern Appalachian

Catskill Abbreviations
FSOC/CWC=Folksongs of the Catskills/Camp Woodland Collection (Norman Cazden/Herbert Haufrecht/Norman Studer)
CWC=Camp Woodland Collection Collection (Norman Cazden/Herbert Haufrecht/Norman Studer) (Jones)
FSH=Folklore of the Schoharie Hills (Emelyn Elizabeth Gardner)
BBB=Body, Boots, and Britches (Harold Thompson)
LCJ=Louis C. Jones Collection
OTMM=Old-Time Music Makers of New York (Simon Bronner)
DOTW=Depth of the Well (Cherry Valley High School oral history project)
PS=Pioneer Songster
HFR=Hartwick College Field Recording
Warner=Traditional American Folksongs from the Anne and Frank Warner Collection
Ms= manuscript
Rec=recording

We have 20 that come in at the top of the scale and 11 that come in at the number 4 rating. This means 55 percent of these song lyrics are identical or close to identical to their counterparts. The others are related to varying degrees to their counterparts.

This list expands greatly if we add non-archival Southern sources (Sharp, Cox, Campbell, etc.) but we limited our comparison at this time to Berea archival materials only.

It is relatively easy to note similarities between versions of songs. But examining the differences can be far more instructive.

Let’s put two examples side by side and examine them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cambric Shirt, North Carolina</th>
<th>Petticoat Lane, Catskills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cambric Shirt</strong></td>
<td><strong>Petticoat Lane</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Joanne Moser, Celebration of Traditional Music 1974</td>
<td>- Collected by Herbert Haufrecht</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Catskill Mountains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. (No introductory verse)</td>
<td>1. As I walked out on Petticoat Lane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Burden: Oh, me rose, be married in time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There I saw a pretty fair maid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Burden: Who choose to be a true lover of mine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. **Will you make me a cambric shirt**  
  Burden: Parserly, sage, rosemary and time  
  Without any needle or seamster’s work?  
  Burden: And you shall be a true lover of me  |
| 2. **Can you make me a cambric shirt...**  
  Burden: Oh, me rose, be married in time  
  Without any thread of fine needlework?...  
  Burden: And you shall be a true lover of mine  |
| 3. **Will you wash it on yonder’s well...**  
  Where there is no water, and rain never fell?...  |
| 3. **Can you wash it in yonder well...**  
  Where water never ran nor rain never fell?...  |
| 4. **Will you dry it on yonder’s thorn...**  
  That’s never bloomed blossom since Adam was born?..  |
| 4. **Can you dry it on yonder thorn**  
  That’s never born bud since Adam was born?...  |
| 5. **Now you’ve asked me questions three...**  
  If you can answer as many for me...  |
| 5. **Well now that you’ve asked your questions three...**  
  I’ll grant the same favor back unto thee...  |
| 6. **Will you find an acre of land**  
  Betwixt the salt water and the sea sand?  |
| 6. **Can you find me an acre of land...**  
  Between the salt waters and the sea sand?...  |
| 7. **And will you plow it with a ram’s horn...**  
  And sow it and plant it all down in corn?...  |
| 7. **Can you plow it with a buckhorn...**  
  And seed it down with one ear of corn?...  |
| 8. **Will you reap it with a sickle of leather...**  |
| 8. **Can you reap it with a penknife...**  
  And draw it down with three yokes of |
And haul it home on a pea fowl’s feather?

9. And when you’ve done and finished your work...
Then come and get your cambric shirt...

mice?...

9. After you’ve gone and done your work...
Come back to me and I’ll make you your shirt...

Let us examine the different uses of language.

In verse two, we have dueling colloquialisms: the Southern “seamster” and the Northern “any thread of fine needlework.” (“thread of” is the colloquialism; but one of Childs’ versions did have “stich of needlework.”)

In verse three, the Southerner asks “Will you” and the Northerner asks “Can you.” The first is a softer sounding word and it implies a choice to act on the part of the other party. “Can you” is a challenge to prove that one is capable of acting. A fine point, but I think the use of “Will” is a little subtler than “Can.” “Can” is blunter. Also, the Catskill version has a nice bit of alliteration: “water never ran and rain never fell,” which gives it a tumbling forward, more rhythmic feel.

In verse four, the Catskill version says bluntly, “Never born bud.” The Southern says “never bloomed blossom,” a soft-sounding alliterative device, and a poetic one.

Verse five, and it is the Catskill version that uses the archaic language: “I’ll grant the same favor back unto thee.”

Verse six, and the Southern uses the archaic term “betwixt.”
Verse seven, and it’s the Southern ram’s horn versus the Northern buckhorn. Ram’s horns are mentioned in the Bible a lot, so one can make a case here for this being an archaic term. “Buckhorn” is a sharper-sounding, more clipped word.

Verse eight, and the Southern version uses a regionalism: a pea fowl feather. There are not too many pea fowl’s in the North. “Draw it down” is either a Catskill colloquialism or archaic term.

Verse nine, “And after you’ve done and finished your work,” Southern colloquialism; “After you’ve gone and done your work”, blunter language in the Catskill version.

So what’s to see here?
For one thing, the Catskill version has three versions of blunter language than the Southern, reflecting local dialect and speech. There is a “clip” to the Catskill accent reminiscent of New England; it’s what gives the “been-here’s” away from the “come-here’s.” Can you. Never born bud. Buckhorn. The use of the language is harder-sounding, and this is reflected in the language choice.
Second, the Southern colloquialisms (pea fowl feather, seamster, gone and done your work) are poetic and rather charming. There is only one Northern one, except for the overall style of speech, which is rather everyday. Notice that the one Catskill colloquialism is, if not blunter, more haughty. Third, there are more archaic phrases in the Southern version: bloomed blossom, betwixt, ram’s horn to the Catskills one “I’ll grant the same favor back unto thee.”

We found these three tendencies to be consistent in general when comparing lyrics from the two areas.

Graph Two: Determining Periods and Modes of Transmission
This is a harder topic. There are often no definite answers to the question of when and where a folk song originated or traveled. It is now generally accepted that a folksong begins with a single piece, to which everyone adds their own variation either intentionally or through faulty memory (contrary to the old “Collective Creation” argument that Josiah Combs spent many pages refuting. Actually, one might still that folksongs are collective creations – but contributions don’t happen in the same place at the same time). There is often a
piecemeal quality to ballads as well. Often, an American ballad may contain a few lines or verses from one ballad, and a few from another.

We can in discern when and where a song was written if we know the composer and there is a record of publication. Broadsides and publications tell us that a song was in existence by a particular date, but they do not tell us whether that song was created and sung earlier. Sometimes there are competing claims as to the time and place of origins of a song. If there is historical information in the song, that can be a clue as to time of origin.

Besides historical data, the use of language is informative. The presence of archaic phrases in a song would certainly indicate an early point of creation than one without; however, an older song can have those phrases weeded out by a succession of singers who don’t know the meanings of them any longer, or just wish to change them, or ones who simply forget.

One characteristic, North and South, seems to be that the older the song, the more variants there are. This makes sense. If you pass a piece of paper from hand to hand, there will be more fingerprints on it if more people touch it. So it is with folk songs. It is and always will be a giant game of telephone – so much so that if we heard the original message, we would not believe it to be true. Finally, though we have tried to do as much background research as possible, there will always be sources we have missed, and therefore, the conclusion I reach may in some cases be incomplete or even inaccurate.

Keeping that in mind, let’s give it a try.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Southern Appalachian Title</th>
<th>Southern Appalachian Source</th>
<th>Catskill Title</th>
<th>Catskill Source</th>
<th>Period and manner of Transmission</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abdullah Bul-Bul Ameer</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid, ms</td>
<td>Sons of the Prophets</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
<td>Written 1877 by Percy French for Trinity College concert. Became</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
used in British music hall acts.

**Best estimate: Heard in performance in both locations, spread orally.** Composed by John Newton a and published 1779, but this Catskill version is a “revival hymn.” It took revivals a while to spread North from their inception in 1801, so.

**Best estimate: South to North, 1840’s on. Unless it spread from New England with the influx of settlers in the early 1800’s.** Reported by Korson to be a song sung by wagonners in the early 1800’s. Minstrel Show tune; minstrel shows were popular in Upstate New York from the mid 1800’s on.
**Awake, Awake, You Drowsy Sleepers**
(Wake Up CTM both), Silver Dagger

Best estimate
Third party transmission in Pennsylvania, early 1800's; after 1800's, spread by minstrel shows.

Early data supports early existence in both areas; it's really two songs, Silver Dagger and Awake Awake. A broadside mixed them in 1890. Since both of these versions mixed, too,

Best estimate:
After 1890, these versions are from written broadsides, spread orally and mixed with local tradition.

Written by Billy Gashade, 1882, according to the song, who by some accounts, was a black man.

Best estimate:
South to North, mid 1800's.

---

**Ballad of Jesse James, Jesse James**
Josiah Combs FSD

**Ballad of Jesse James, The**
Josiah Combs FSD
Banks of the Sweet Dundee, The; Farmer's Daughter, The

Best estimate: Came to both areas with the 1820's settlers. Mentioned in 1666 by Samuel Pepys in London as a "...charming little Scots song." Possibly came over with the first settlers.

Barbara Allen, Barbry Allen (lyrics only)

Best estimate: Both areas simultaneous transmission with early settlers from Britain, or North to South via third party during migrationwest. Poem by Virginia Frances Townsend, published in poetry sections of newspapers during migrationwest.
Civil War ca. 1912. Boston Globe was one. Likely set to music in North, then spread.

**Best estimate:**
*North to South, ca. 1912-1917.*

Apparently, there are some reports of a similar song in England in 1846, and sheet music published in Boston in 1847, nothing extant.

**Best estimate:**
*Learned from sheet music, transmitted during Civil War, North to South.*

It’s listed in O’Neill, 1850 (Chicago).

**Best estimate:**
*South to North, early 1800’s, third party transmission, or with settlers during 1820’s immigration to the south.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Billy Boy</th>
<th>Bradley Kincaid ms, sb, rec</th>
<th>Billy Boy</th>
<th>FSH, LCJ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bonaparte's Retreat</td>
<td>BTL</td>
<td>Bonaparte's Retreat</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Boston Burglar  
BTL; Josiah Combs FSD  
Boston Burglar, The  
SOC/CWC (Celia Kelder); LCJ

Broadside, around 1880. There’s a KY adaptation: The Bowling Green Burglar.

Best estimate:  
North to South, 1880’s.

Morgan’s Rangers, riflemen from KY, fought on the Northern frontier (Catskills) during the Revolution, and they also fought at the Battle of Quebec 1777.

In the earlier Battle of Quebec in 1759, Wolf died on the Plains of Abraham. This song likely had personal resonance for soldiers who participated in the 1777 battle.

Best estimate:  
1750’s-1770’s,  
North to South with returning KY soldiers.

Catskill has more verses. This means either the

Brave Wolf  
Josiah Combs FSD  
Battle of Montcalm and Wolf  
BBB

Butcher Boy  
Asa Martin rec 1930;  
Butcher Boy  
Grant Rogers, BBB
Northern source added verses, or the tune traveled South and lost verses along the way.

**Best estimate:**
Second migration, early 1800's
Britain to both areas.

Childs Ballad # 2,
The Elfin Knight.
Child lists over 70 variants of it, indicating it's been around for quite awhile.

This is a very old ballad, British Isles. Probably came over simultaneously in the first migration, and continued to come in subsequent migrations.

**Best estimate:**
very early creation, perhaps as early as the late 1400's.

Transmission
1600's-1700's, British Isles to America with early settlers, spread to Catskills and Southern Appalachian with migration west.
Korson claims it was a favorite of waggoners in the early 1800's in Pennsylvania. Good possibility of transmittance at that time if true.

Dates to mid 1800’s according to Bronner.

First published 1856.
Possibly popular song in Civil War, or from an 1871 English Music Hall singer. Notes resemblance to “100 Pipers”)

Glasgow broadside 1868.

Mentioned in Laura Ingalls Wilder
books.

Mudcat.org reports another publication in 1826, London.

**Best estimate: All of the above.**

**Brought by Scots/Irish immigrants in the 1800’s to both areas, and spread more by English music hall tours.**

This is Zip Coon, a minstrel tune, probably African-American origin.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chicken Reel</th>
<th>Asa Martin rec</th>
<th>Chicken Reel</th>
<th>OTMM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cindy</td>
<td>BTL, Bradley Kincaid ms</td>
<td>Cindy</td>
<td>NC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Best Estimate:**

**African-American fiddlers to white fiddlers, Mid 1800’s, then South to North**

I have not found any significant lyrical or musical variants of this, which indicate a later period of creation.

**Best estimate:**

**Mid-1800’s, south to North based on**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song Name</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Collection</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cruel Ship's Carpenter</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Ship's Carpenter</td>
<td>SOC/CWC (George Edwards)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuckoo Is a a Pretty Bird</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid sb;</td>
<td></td>
<td>A-Walkin' and A-Talkin'</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Character of Music.**

**Best estimate:**

1600’s-1700’s, British Isles to America with early settlers, spread to Southern Appalachian with migration west. This song has some verses from Lass Of Roch Royal (Childs 76), and is probably one of the best traveled folk songs of all time. Kincaid’s version matches Edwards quite a bit but has more verses. Edwards claimed he learned his song from his mother in the early 1900’s, which would rule out Kincaid’s Catskill influence...Both songs descendents of the older song.

**Best estimate:**

Lass of Roch Royal came over 1600’s-1700’s, British Isles to America with
early settlers, spread to Southern Appalachian with migration west.

Best estimate:
Came to America with early settlers, spread to Southern Appalachian with migration west.

Cuel Mother (The Greenwood Sidie KJF)
CTM 2012 Betty Smith; KJ French FBC, ms; Josiah Combs FSD
Down By the Greenwood Shady SOC/CWC (Marvin Yale)

Darby Ram BTL; Josiah Combs mention FSD
Darby Ram, The SOC/CWC (Mike Todd); NC (mention)

Darling Nellie Gray Asa Martin, recording 1931; BTL Nellie Gray FSH; CWC

Best estimate:
Could have gone three ways: 1. From Britain with the immigrants to both areas 1800’s; 2. British Music Hall 1800’s; 3. Broadsides and printed music. 4. Wagoners passing through Pennsylvania

Bronner says that the lyrics were composed by Benjamin Russel Hanby and published in Boston 1856, written for minstrel stage. Became
popular through sales of broadsides, performances as a parlor song. Also became a dance tune up North.

**Best estimate:**
1860’s, spread by minstrel shows and Civil War, North to South

“Jesse James” was written by Billy Gashade, or so the song claims. Song written after James’ death in 1882.

Laws mentions it in 1906.

Lomax says the last verse was added by a Missouri Negro...probably written soon enough after James’ death to be topical.

The KY version is about a local murder, which occurred much
Best estimate: James: 1880's and spread via newspapers and orally. Markum spread orally and in possibly newspapers. According to Cazden, goes back to a 1630 broadside, “How the divell was guld by a scould” (Roxburghe). So it’s likely it came over early, when it was popular.

Best estimate: written early 1600's, brought from /Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800's. Similar tune, “Devil Among the Tailors” in England.

Best estimate: Based on musical character of piece,
transmission in the early 1800’s, Scotland to both locales. Cowboy song, I think; most likely spread during the Civil War and post-war migrations and became more popular in the North due to Kincaid and others.

**Best estimate:** South to North, Civil War, and Radio 1930’s. According to Cazden, poem published in New England Diadem and Rhode Island Temperance pledge in 1850. H Thompson cites one printed in a NY manuscript 1856.

**Best estimate:** Transmitted to Bradley Kincaid while he was in the Catskills in the 1930’s, North to South transmission.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Desk Name</th>
<th>Region/Label</th>
<th>Desk Name</th>
<th>Region/Label</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fisher's Hornpipe</td>
<td>BTL</td>
<td>Fisher's Hornpipe</td>
<td>OTMM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foggy Dew, The</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid, rec; Josiah Combs</td>
<td>Foggy Foggy Dew,</td>
<td>SOC/CWC (George Edwards); SOC; NC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Best estimate:**
Scottish/Irish origin, likely brought with the early 1800's immigrants. Britain to both places.

Combs’ version is Bugaboo, not Foggy Dew. Don’t have

Since the tune is the same in both places (rare), let’s look at its origin for clues. The tune is first found matched to another song in 1828, where it’s marked “Old Irish Melody” (Cazden). It’s found in A Pioneer Songster, compiled 1841-1856 by a New Englander in Western New York...The character of the piece seems almost parlor song...**Best estimate: Tune and song were**
matched early on in America, 1820’s, after the second wave of immigration and spread through migration and meeting places en route.

Song goes back to the 1600’s, so true to form, there are many, many variants.

Best estimate: written early 1600’s, brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s.

Best estimate: written early 1600’s, brought from England by original settlers to America.

Bronner says this was written by black minstrel songwriter James Bland in the
1870’s, tho he was rarely credited. .

**Best estimate:**
North to South, 1870’s, via minstrel shows.

*Pioneer Songster* says it was likely written by Samuel Wordsworth, first performed onstage by an actor dressed like a Kentucky rifleman, presumably in buckskin, spread like wildfire, and was published 1824. Became popular with soldiers during the Mexican-American War.

**Best estimate:** composition after War of 1812, transmission South to North with soldiers returning from the later Mexican-American War.

Same tune.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hunters of Kentucky, The</th>
<th>Bradley Kincaid</th>
<th>Hunters of Kentucky, The PS</th>
<th>Irish Washerwoman</th>
<th>Brian O’Linn</th>
<th>Washerwoman</th>
<th>OTMM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(index)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTL; Tune used by Mary Lozier to Laine County Bachelor and Irish</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1820’s, during the second wave of immigration and spread west and south with the settlers. Britain to American, 1820’s. No early record of this one up North.

Best estimate: Created mid 1800’s, brought North by contact during Civil War, then by radio in the 1930’s. South to North, 1930’s. Every place this song has ever been sung claims paternity, making it difficult to place its origins with any precision. Maine, Michigan, New York, Kentucky, Nova Scotia have all claimed to contain the site of Gerry’s Rock. Cazden believes the time of origin to be during the post-Civil War lumber boom in the United States. A handwritten
copy exists in Maine dated 1874. Certain expressions in the song and details match the obituary of a logger in Maine in 1860.

Best estimate: Written early 1860’s, spread from Maine to the Catskills by lumberman, from the Catskills to Michigan by lumbermen, and from Michigan to Kentucky by returning Kentucky loggers, 1890’s, during the Michigan lumber boom.


Best estimate: 1930’s, transmission by
radio, South to North.
Best estimate:
Brought from England by original settlers to America, 1600s-1720, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s. Evidence that this has been around for quite awhile by virtue of the number of variations and spinoffs (Billy Boy, etc.)

Best estimate:
written early 1600’s, brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s.
Best estimate:
brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song Title</th>
<th>Source and Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mary Golden Tree, The; Turkish Revele or Lowlands Low (KJF) (also lists Green Willow Tree and Golden Vanitee)</td>
<td>BTL; KJ French ms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bold Trellitree, The</td>
<td>SOC/CWC (George Edwards)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Still in the old Kentucky Home</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms; rec; CTM 1974; BTL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madam, I Have Gold and Silver</td>
<td>SOC recording (Barbara Moncure)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Dan Tucker</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BTL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Old Dan Tucker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NC, BBB, LCJ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**late 1700-early 1800's.**
Probably dating from the 1600's, judging by content matter.

**Best estimate:**
written 1600's, brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800's.
Proof of existence in the Catskills by 1873. Character of both tunes very British.

**Best estimate:**
written 1700's, brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800's.
Virginia Minstrels popularized this in 1843, but that doesn't mean it wasn't around.
earlier. It’s credited to Emmett, who, it is suspected, lifted many African-American songs including Dixie. Lots of verses in different places to this one – Perhaps that particular aspect came about via the waggoners, re: the Pennsylvania Dutch tradition of zersingen (singing to pieces, competitions where verses were parodied on the spot of songs as a competition) (Korson).

Best estimate: Minstrel show and Civil War transmission, 1850-1865. This song was reported in 1853 in an African Methodist Church in Chicago. Also in the earliest formal collections of African-American
music that I encountered, _Slave Songs of the United States, 1867_, though white composers claimed credit for the song a few decades later.

**Best estimate:**
Transmission
African American to white via revival shows, South to North via revival shows, mid to late 1800’s.

Same story, same verse content, different lines in many cases though...probably been around long enough for all those mutations. Language not particularly archaic in either case.

**Best estimate:**
Unsure. Possibly third party transmission, early 1800’s, direction unknown.

Part of this song comes out of The

| Pretty Mohee, Maumee, Little Mohea | BTL; Josiah Combs JAFL Bradley Kincaid ms, sb; Addie Graham, | Lass of Mohee BBB Pretty Polly FSH |
Cruel House Carpenter.

Best estimate: brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s. Catskills retained the old full story; Southern Appalachia truncated it and put it in more compelling musical settings. Best estimate: created in South, third party transmission, early 1800’s, South to North.

Carl Sandburg in American Songbag claims the original version was “Bright Mohawk Valley.” Seems to have the same tune everywhere...Best estimate: Probably created mid 1800’s, traveled during the
Civil War, direction uncertain. This is really a dance version of Robert Schumann’s “The Happy Farmer,” with a different B section. Style of the tune is southern.

Best estimate: Created in the South, mid 1800’s, traveled north with Civil War soldiers returning home. Simple zipper song. Found in the attic of a Saugerties Schoolgirl 1873, according to William G. Tyrell. Both tunes seem based on Revolutionary War fife tunes...likely composed during the Revolution, returned South with returning soldiers.

Best estimate: Composition 1760’s-1770’s, North to South
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soldier's Joy</td>
<td>Josiah Combs</td>
<td>Best estimate: Creation shortly after 1761. Transmission, North to South following American Revolution and during migration south and west at meeting places, 1771-1830. Studer reports numerous conflicting claims of authorship, North, South, and Scottish; story is about fighting Indians in Texas. Early KY version places it on the Ohio.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield Mountain</td>
<td>Josiah Combs</td>
<td>Best estimate: Created in American, late 1800's in Texas,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas Rangers, The</td>
<td>BTL; Josiah Combs</td>
<td>Best estimate: Created in American, late 1800's in Texas,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
brought to Southern Appalachia by returning soldiers, traveled via lumber camps in Michigan to the Catskills. There is a version from before the Civil War in a Michigan diary, begun in New York state.

**Best estimate:**
British origin, 1700’s. Brought from England/Scotland by early settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s.

**True Lover's Farewell, The; My Dearest Dear (JC), The Lover's (KJF)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song Title</th>
<th>Collection</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Wealthy Merchant of London</td>
<td>KJ French ms</td>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>George Edwards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Rich Merchant</td>
<td>BBB; SOC/CWC</td>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>George Edwards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fare You Well, My Own True Love</td>
<td>SOC/CWC (George</td>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>George Edwards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Edwards)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
waggoners and immigrants west, early to mid 1800’s. Korson claims it was a favorite of waggoners in Pennsylvania.

**Turkey in the Straw**

Asa Martin, recording 1932; BTL; Josiah Combs mention FSD

Best estimate:
Likely origin:
African-American fiddlers in the South, transported North by third parties (waggoners), early 1800’s, later became more popular from use in minstrel shows. South to North.

**Two Sisters (Lord of the Old Country FBC)**

Bradley Kincaid sb, rec 1928; Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French FBC, ms

Best estimate:
brought from England/Scotland by original settlers to America, then west to Appalachia and Catskills in late 1700-early 1800’s.

**Wayfaring Pilgrim**

Bradley Kincaid (index)

Best estimate:
African-American creation to Shape Note tune variant in South, traveled North during Civil War and later.
Part Two: The Music

The tunes. Finally, what about the tunes to these songs?

In many cases, we did not have melodies to the songs. Some songs were found on recordings in the Sound Archives. Of the Southern written collections, Combs usually only collected lyrics (as was the vogue among collectors then), as did Kincaid. Both did notate some of the tunes, though, so in some cases, we have something for comparison. Both French and Smith collected tunes to match many of the lyrics in their collections.

As for the Catskill written sources, only Gardner, Warner, and Cazden include melodies. We also used the Songs of the Catskills and Grant Rogers recording, as well as pieces collected for The Depth of the Well.

Working with what we have, let us set up a scale to compare melodies:

5 – Same melody, or same with only minor changes
4 – Same melody shape
3 – Either the A or B are the same
2 – Either the A or B have the same shape as their counterpart
1 – No match whatsoever.

I am not counting meter; this can shift too easily depending on the singer and collector.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Southern Appalachian Title</th>
<th>Southern Appalachian Source</th>
<th>Catskill Title</th>
<th>Catskill Source</th>
<th>Melody Similarity Appalachian/Catskill</th>
<th>Mode/scale usage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abdullah Bul-Bul Ameer</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid, ms</td>
<td>Sons of the Prophets</td>
<td>NC</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>No melody given, North or South</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>No Northern melody.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>Southern: Combs’ Version: He is notating the improvisation that is occurring to the usual tune of Amazing Grace. It’s really F major, with a flat 7th occasionally. Major.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amazing Grace</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD Primitve Baptist tune</td>
<td>Amazing grace</td>
<td>FSH (&quot;Revival Hymn&quot;)</td>
<td>5 Same</td>
<td>Major, all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas Traveler</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid m; Asa Martin rec 1927; BTL</td>
<td>Arkansaas Traveler</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (Emmett Bryden, Aaron Van de Bogart Sr.); NC</td>
<td>Smith/Edwards: 3</td>
<td>Catskill: Edwards: Gapped scale, Major scale, no 7th. Southern: Smith: gapped scale, no sixth but otherwise pentatonic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banks of the Sweet Dudee, The (Maid JC2)</td>
<td>Go Tell Aunt Rhody; Josiah Combs FSD; KJF mention, FBC</td>
<td>Banks of Sweet Dundee, The; Farmer’s Daughter, The; Undaunted Lass, The</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); BBB</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Catskill version: Gapped scale, minor, no sixth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbara Allen</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms, sb, rec 1928; BTL (3 pent</td>
<td>Barbara Allen, Barbry Allen</td>
<td>NC, BBB</td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/</td>
<td>/</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Contributor(s)</td>
<td>Lyrics/Notes</td>
<td>Archive</td>
<td>Melody</td>
<td>Scale/Key</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Battle of Gettysburg, The</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td></td>
<td>FSOC/CWC</td>
<td>No Southern archival melody given</td>
<td>Pentatonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FSD dif tune; KJ French</td>
<td></td>
<td>Battle of Gettysburg (George Edwards)</td>
<td>/ Catskill: Edwards: Dorian, no 3rd</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Billy Boy</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms, sb,</td>
<td>Billy Boy</td>
<td>FSH, LCJ</td>
<td>No Northern melody.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>rec</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/ Southern: Kincaid sb:</td>
<td>Pentatonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bonaparte's Retreat</td>
<td>BTL, Asa Martin (rec)</td>
<td>Bonaparte's Retreat</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
<td>No Northern melody.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/ Martin’s is different than the version I know from up North. Same tune, but his is way less busy. Gapped scale, Major key no 7th, except for the Snake Charmer quote in the C. (Today, major)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston Burglar</td>
<td>BTL; Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Boston Burglar, The</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (Celia Kelder); LCJ</td>
<td>No archival Southern melody.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/ Catskill: Edwards: Gapped scale, major, no 7th.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brave Wolf</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD ms</td>
<td>Ballad of Montcalm and Wolf</td>
<td>BBB</td>
<td>No melody North or South</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/ Rogers and Kincaid: Major, both North and South.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butcher Boy/Jersey City, The</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms; Asa</td>
<td>Butcher Boy, The</td>
<td>Grant Rogers, BBB</td>
<td>Rogers and Kincaid: 5</td>
<td>Major, both North and South.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Martin rec 1930; BTL JC;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/ Catskill: Dorian to Aolian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CTM (Jim/Doug Trentham); Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Southern: Moser: Mixolydian to Dorian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambric Shirt</td>
<td>Joanne Moser CTM 1974;</td>
<td>Petticoat Lane; Cambric Shirt</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); BBB</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Catskill: Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kitteridge, JAFL (in Kincaid) (ev rose merry in time)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Southern: Moser: Mixolydian to Dorian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>/ Catskill: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Captain Jinks</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Captain Jinks</td>
<td>BBB; LC; CWC; OTMM</td>
<td>No Southern archival melody.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicken Reel</td>
<td>Asa Martin rec</td>
<td>Chicken Reel</td>
<td>OTMM</td>
<td>4 Basically the same tune.</td>
<td>Major both</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Collectors / Sources</td>
<td>Key</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cindy</td>
<td>BTL, Bradley Kincaid ms</td>
<td>Cindy</td>
<td>No Northern melody.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lots more ornamentation in Martin’s version.</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Southern: Kincaid: Gapped major, no 7th.</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cruel Ship’s Carpenter, The</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD ms</td>
<td>Ship’s Carpenter</td>
<td>No Southern archival melody</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cindy</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Catskill: F major but mostly gapped scale. 7th occurs at the end onlyl.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuckoo Is a Pretty Bird, The; Cuckoo</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid sb; BTL</td>
<td>A-Walkin’ and A-Talkin’</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Catskill: Edwards: Gapped scale, pure minor no fourth or sixth. (C pentatonic with an A tonality)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*Southern: Kincaid sb: suggests pentatonic but no sixth. Gapped scale.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuel Mother (The Greenwood Sidie KJF)</td>
<td>CTM 2012 Betty Smith; KJ French FBC, ms; Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Down By the Greenwood Shady</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Catskill: Yale: pentatonic</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Southern: Smith: pentatonic</em>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darby Ram</td>
<td>BTL; Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Darby Ram, The</td>
<td>/ No archival southern source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Catskill: Todd: pentatonic (sounds Irish)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*Southern: Todd: pentatonic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darling Nellie Gray</td>
<td>Asa Martin, recording 1931; BTL</td>
<td>Nellie Gray</td>
<td>/ No Northern melody.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Southern: Smith: pentatonic</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Martin: Major</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Death of JB Markum, The</td>
<td>Asa Martin rec 1928;,Addie Graham,BK field rec;</td>
<td>Ballad of Jesse James, The</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>For the Chorus; Northern informant couldn’'t recall more.</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*Southern: Smith: pentatonic Martin: Major.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devil and the Farmer’s Wife; Farmer’s Curst Wife</td>
<td>BTL (Jean Ritchie)</td>
<td>Devil and the Farmer’s Wife, the</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Catskill: Yale: Gapped scale, major, no 7th.</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>Southern: Smith: Major</em>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>S1</td>
<td>S2</td>
<td>Note</td>
<td>S3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devil's Dream</td>
<td>BTL</td>
<td>Devil's Dream</td>
<td>OTNN</td>
<td>Same today, likely / No Southern archival melody. / Catskill: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Down in the Valley</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms</td>
<td>Down in the Valley</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
<td>/ No Northern melody. / Southern: Kincaid: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fisher's Hornpipe</td>
<td>BTL</td>
<td>Fisher's Hornpipe</td>
<td>OTMM mention</td>
<td>/ No Northern or Southern melody. / Catskill: major.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foggy Dew, The</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid, rec; Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Foggy Foggy Dew, Foggy Dew</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); SOC; NC</td>
<td>4 / Kincaid matches both Catskill melodies / Catskill: Edwards: pure minor Moncure: pure minor / Southern Kincaid rec: pure minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Froggie Went a-Courting', Frog's Courtship</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid sb, rec; Josiah Combs FSD w/dif tune</td>
<td>A Frog, He Would a-Wooing Go, same; Missie Mouse</td>
<td>NC; FSOC/CWC (Marvin Yale); SOC rec</td>
<td>2 / Catskill: Yale: Lydian (could have meant major) / Southern Combs: major Kincaid: Gapped scale, major, no sixth.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girl I Left Behind Me, The</td>
<td>Mary Lozier BK field rec; Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Girl I Left Behind Me, The</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); NC; CWC; OTMM</td>
<td>Lozier and OTMM: 5 Major both</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden Slippers</td>
<td>BTL (mention)</td>
<td>Golden Slippers</td>
<td>OTMM, NC; HFR (William Powers)</td>
<td>/ No Southern archival melody. / Catskill: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Song Title</td>
<td>Artist(s)</td>
<td>Note(s)</td>
<td>Reference(s)</td>
<td>Key</td>
<td>Additional Info</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irish Washerwoman</td>
<td>BTL; Tune used by Mary Lozier to Laine County Bachelor and Brian O’Linn</td>
<td>Irish Washerwoman</td>
<td>OTMM</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Major both</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jam at Gerry’s Rock</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD (mention)</td>
<td>Jam at Gerry’s Rock; Jam on Gerrion’s Rock (Warner); Jam on Jerry’s Rock (LJC and OTMM)</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards, Elston Von Wagner, Dick Edwards); Warner; LCJ; OTMM</td>
<td>No archival Southern melody.</td>
<td>Catskill: Edwards: Mixolydian D. Edwards: Major Van Wagner: Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Henry</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French FBC, ms</td>
<td>John Henry</td>
<td>NC (mention)</td>
<td>No Northern or Southern melody.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letter Edged in Black</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms, rec; BTL</td>
<td>Letter Edged in Black</td>
<td>OTMM</td>
<td>5 Penultimate measure a touch different; rest is same.</td>
<td>Major both</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Lovell</td>
<td>BTL ; KJ French FBC, ms</td>
<td>Lord Lovell</td>
<td>BBB; FSOC/CWC (Printed, George K. Hamilton); FSH</td>
<td>No Southern archival melody</td>
<td>Catskill (printed version by Hamilton) Uses only 12358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord Randall</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French ms</td>
<td>Lord Randall</td>
<td>LCJ</td>
<td>No Northern melody.</td>
<td>Southern: Combs: pentatonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maid Saved From the Gallows, The; Hangman, Hangman (Ropeman), Hold Your Rope (BTL)</td>
<td>BTL; Josiah Combs FSD mention</td>
<td>Maid Freed from the Gallows, Hangman</td>
<td>BBB</td>
<td>No melody North or South.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Golden Tree, The; Turkish Revele or</td>
<td>BTL; KJ French ms</td>
<td>Bold Trellitree, The</td>
<td>FSOC/CWC (George Edwards)</td>
<td>Edwards/French 1</td>
<td>Catskill: Edwards: Dorian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms, rec; Kincaid CTM 1974; ONS BTL</td>
<td>Madam, I Have Gold and Silver</td>
<td>SOC recording (Barbara Moncure)</td>
<td>Kincaid ms/Monica: 1 Kincaid rec/Monica: 5</td>
<td>Southern: French: Em gapped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lowlands Low(KJF)(also lists Green Willow Tree and Golden Vanitee)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Bradley Kincaid ms; BTL</strong></td>
<td><strong>Old Dan Tucker</strong></td>
<td><strong>NC mention, BBB, LCJ</strong> for no Northern or Southern melody given.</td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Oh, No, John/Oh, No, Sir</strong></td>
<td><strong>BTL</strong></td>
<td><strong>Old Dan Tucker</strong></td>
<td><strong>FSOC/CWC (Aaron Van de Bogart, Sr.); LCJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Old Ship of Zion</strong></td>
<td><strong>BTL</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ship of Zion</strong></td>
<td><strong>FSOC/CWC (Aaron Van de Bogart, Sr.); LCJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pretty Mohee, Maumee, Little Mohea</strong></td>
<td><strong>BTL; Josiah Combs JAFL</strong></td>
<td><strong>Lass of Mohee</strong></td>
<td><strong>BBB</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pretty Polly</strong></td>
<td><strong>Bradley Kincaid ms, sb; Addie Graham, BK field rec; BTL; CTM (McClain Family); Josiah Combs FSDSU; KJ French FBC</strong></td>
<td><strong>Pretty Polly</strong></td>
<td><strong>FSH</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pretty Sarah (Saro)</strong></td>
<td><strong>BTL; Josiah Combs FSDSU</strong></td>
<td><strong>Pretty Saro</strong></td>
<td><strong>LCJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Red River Valley</strong></td>
<td><strong>Bradley Kincaid ms, rec 1928, rec; Asa Martin rec; BTL</strong></td>
<td><strong>Red River Valley</strong></td>
<td><strong>NC</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Red Wing</strong></td>
<td><strong>BTL with words; Josiah Combs FSDSU</strong></td>
<td><strong>Red Wing</strong></td>
<td><strong>NC; FFR (Chubb McClean)</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
<td><strong>/</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Song</td>
<td>Composer</td>
<td>Setting</td>
<td>Reference</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soldier, Soldier, Will You Marry Me?</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid ms, sb</td>
<td>Madame, I Have Gold and Silver</td>
<td>SOC rec NC mention</td>
<td>Catskill: Major, obvious fife tune</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Southern: Kincaid sb: pantatonic except for a fourth at the end. Also a fife tune, likely.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soldier's Joy</td>
<td>BTL; Josiah Combs mention FSD</td>
<td>Soldier's Joy</td>
<td>OTMM; NC; HFR (William Powers);</td>
<td>Catskill: Both OTMM’s are major.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>HFR major and simple</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield Mountain</td>
<td>Josiah Combs FSD</td>
<td>Springfield Mountain</td>
<td>BBB; Warner; NC mention</td>
<td>Catskill: Warner: Bb pentatonic (G doubled gapped minor, no second or sixth)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas Rangers, The</td>
<td>BTL mention; Josiah Combs FSD mention</td>
<td>Texas Rangers, The</td>
<td>FSO/CWC (George Edwards, Elston Van Wagner); LCJ</td>
<td>Catskill: Edwards: Major Van Wagner: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Southern: BTL: Major (field transcriptions)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Wealthy Merchant of London</td>
<td>KJ French ms</td>
<td>The Rich Merchant</td>
<td>BBB; FSO/CWC (George Edwards)</td>
<td>Catskill: Edwards: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>True Lover's Farewell, The; My Dearest Dear (JC), The Lover's (KJF)</td>
<td>Bradley Kincaid sb; Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French FBC, ms</td>
<td>Fare You Well, My Own True Love; A-Walkin' and a-Talkin</td>
<td>FSO/CWC (George Edwards)</td>
<td>Catskill: Fare You Well: Major A Walkin: Gapped minor, no sixth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Southern: Kincaid: Major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey in the Straw (tune)</td>
<td>Asa Martin, recording 1932 mentioned; BTL mention; Josiah Combs mention FSD</td>
<td>Turkey in the Straw</td>
<td>OTMM; NC; HFR (William Powers); OTMM</td>
<td>Catskill: Both OTMM first five notes of major scale.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Two Sisters (Lord of the Old Country FBC) Bradley Kincaid sb, rec 1928; Josiah Combs FSD; KJ French FBC, ms Two Sisters, Twa Sisters BBB / No Northern melody given. 

Southern: Kincaid sb: pentatonic but for penultimate note

Wayfaring Pilgrim Bradley Kincaid (index) Poor and Foreign Stranger; Poor Unworthy Stranger FSOC/CWC (George Edwards); LCJ / No Southern archival melody given. 

Catskill: Edwards: G pentatonic, Or E double gapped minor, no second or sixth.

Unfortunately, there were only 18 songs in which we had melodic sources both from the Berea archives and Catskill sources. That is really too low a number upon which to draw definite conclusions. I look forward to including and other sources in the Berea Archives and finding what they may yield, as well as the Campbell/Sharp collection and other sources in the Catskills. Here is the current data:

**Level/Score**

| 5 – 6* |
| 4 – 2 |
| 3 – 2 |
| 2 – 1 |
| 1 – 7 |

* (Three of these likely have later transmittance dates. Surprisingly, two of them date, I think, from the early periods of transmission (*Butcher Boy, Oh No John*). The source for *Oh No John* was Kincaid, at the CTM in 1974; it’s possible he used a melody he picked up later in his travels.)
A quick look at modes used in these songs is more informative, because we had at least one source for most of them. The numbers will seem odd: that is because there is often more than one version of a song in each locale.

A word about a word:

Pentatonic

Cecil Sharp seemed to think that virtually every song found in the south was really pentatonic at heart, and any other notes found in them were just accidents or late additions. Hence, he labeled his modes “pentatonic/ionian” (major), “pentatonic, aolian” (pure minor), etc. This is theoretically unsound.

A case can be made in some songs that Sharp is right, but unless a note appears only once upon resolution or once as a passing tone, I count all the notes that appear in a particular song in order to determine its mode.

I have also noted when a piece is pentatonic but in a minor mode, i.e., when it has a minor-sounding tonality. These could also be counted as double-gapped minor scales, which are found in some Scottish music. Single gapped (major missing the 7\textsuperscript{th} or minor missing the 6\textsuperscript{th}) is more common, in my experience.

All in all, we find the following:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Catskill</th>
<th>Southern Appalachia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pentatonic:</td>
<td>5 (two are in the minor mode, or a double gapped minor)</td>
<td>11 (two are in the minor mode, or a double gapped minor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major:</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pure Minor:</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gapped Scales:</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dorian:</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixolydian:</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lydian:</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Split modes:</td>
<td>1 (dorian to aolian)</td>
<td>1 (mixolydian to dorian)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other:</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
If we do not count the double-gapped modes, there are only 3 Catskill songs in the pentatonic (2 of which are likely to have migrated South to North), but 9 in the Southern Appalachian. The Sharp collection has an even higher percentage. This begs the following questions:

Why is there so little use of the pentatonic in North, but so much in the South?

Combs makes much of the use of pentatonic scales, saying that it proves that Appalachians are from Elizabethan England (not just white, but the right kind of white, in Combs’ view). There are three problems with this: one, they didn’t use pentatonic scales in Elizabethan music; two, we should see more of it in the Catskill music if he’s right, given the shared ethnicity and time of immigration; and three, the English didn’t settle Appalachia during the Elizabethan Age.

We do find some use of the pentatonic in Scottish music, but it does not comprise the body of Scottish folk tune. If it did, we would undoubtedly find more of it in the Catskill music. We do not. In addition to what we have just seen, in “Folk Songs of the Catskills,” of the first 100 songs, only nine are pentatonic (9%). In contrast, in Bradley Kincaid’s first songbook, we find 20% are pentatonic. Combs’ few transcriptions number at 4 pentatonic out of 10, or 40%. French’s tally comes in at 31% pentatonic.

A cursory glance at the Sharp and Campbell collections confirms the wide presence of the pentatonic scale in Southern Appalachian music. A look at Southern fiddle tunes cements it.

So – how did pentatonic scales become such an intrinsic part of Southern music? What might have influenced Southern music that didn’t influence Northern music?

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=79c9mN9tEfG
You just heard melodies on the Kalimba, an African instrument, that used the pentatonic scale. Some countries in western Africa, from which slaves were kidnapped, used the pentatonic scale in prominent ways.

If slaves brought pentatonic tunes, is there any way to verify their use in early African-American music? Looking at *Old Plantation Hymns*, we find that out of 38 songs, we find that nine are entirely pentatonic, and another 8 are pentatonic but for one passing note. Seven more are gapped. So 45% are pentatonic, entirely or mostly; the 15 gapped ones (40%) may be accounted for either by the importation of their own gapped scale tradition or the appropriation of the Scottish gapped scale used in so much Southern music (or the borrowing of white melodies already in use).

In fact, let us take a look at gapped scales, as well as the Mixolydian and Dorian modes. All of these are found in music of both regions, along with the ubiquitous major and pure minor (Aolian mode).

First, what is a gapped scale? In short, it is a scale comprised of more than five notes and less than 7.

For example, a major scale missing the seventh step, or a minor scale missing the sixth step is a gapped scale.

We found gapped scales to be prevalent in Catskill music, and present in Southern examples from the archive. We find many more of them if we look at the collections of Sharp and Campbell. We also find many more examples of songs using mixolydian and Dorian mode in those collections.
What is a mixolydian scale? In short, it is a major scale with a lowered seventh step. The Dorian is a pure minor scale with a raised sixth step.

Or if we place it in the key of D:

How did these modes get into these musics, and why?

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7yBu-SOxwn4

The Scottish bagpipes are a finicky instrument. The soul of Scottish music, outlawed for centuries, they can move one to tears or set one to run in the opposite direction, depending on the player. The pipes have an unusual feature; playing in the key of D, the most common key of pipe (later fiddle) tunes, the seventh step is out of tune. It is too sharp to be a C natural and too flat to be a C sharp.
You just heard that. Translate those tunes to voice and set words to them, and there are choices to be made: 1. Sing the seventh out of tune, 2. Place it low, as a C natural (which gives the mixolydian mode), or 3. Place it high (which gives the major).

The C quasi sharp is an awkward note to play. It’s easier to skip it. When one does, it produces the most common of gapped scales, the major, missing the seventh.

If one wishes a darker tonality, one can keep the same fingerings but start on E. This means that the quasi note will be the sixth step of the scale. Translate those tunes to voice and set words to them, and there are choices to be made: 1. Sing it out of tune, 2. Place it low, as a C natural (which gives the aolian mode), or 3. Place it high (which gives the dorian mode).
pure minor (Aolian)

Dorian

Or one can skip it altogether:

Example:

(from Lord MacDonald’s Reel)
In minor modalities, it’s much easier on pipes to go

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{\textcopyright{ }} & \text{\textcopyright{ }} \text{\textcopyright{ }} \\
\text{\textcopyright{ }} & \text{\textcopyright{ }} \text{\textcopyright{ }} \\
\end{align*}
\]

than

I believe these two things in combination are the answer to the question: How did the Southern musical language come to be regarding use of scales, and why is it different than that of the Catskills. In the South, there was interaction with African-Americans, and pentatonic scales came into usage. In the North, there was not. In both areas, the people were of Scottish descent and brought the sound of the pipes scales and modes with them to the New World.

**Performance Style**

This is a difficult subject to tackle with equity. There were very few early recordings in the Catskills, so we have slim pickings. It is worth discussion, though.

*Southern Appalachia:* Early Southern recordings were revealing. In early recordings, vocal styles were not high lonesome. In his early recordings (1920’s), Bradley Kincaid sounded very much the Northern Irish tenor. He recorded popular Irish songs like “I'll Take You Home Again, Kathleen” and “In Sweet Iniscarra.” His version of “Foggy Dew” is also in the style of Irish tenors. One wonders if he saw himself embarking upon a career much like Chauncy Olcott or John McCormack. According to Loyal Jones, Kincaid married his college music professor, who influenced his early singing style. Kincaid (at least at first) did not particularly reflect the type of singing heard and recorded deep in the mountains by John and Alan Lomax and other collectors, but then, as Loyal Jones pointed out, Kincaid was not from the mountains proper, but from the flats just below them. At any rate, the songs Kincaid sang and the way he sang them were heard and imitated by Grant Rogers, and later by other Catskillians.

Asa Martin sounded Southern, as far as nasal vocal placement and accent went, from his first recordings. But the high lonesome sound really didn’t come till later, for him and everyone else. It is that mountain-flavored high lonesome that became the defining sound for bluegrass music later on.

As for instruments, even on the early recording we hear strong backbeat in fiddle and guitar. We also hear “wild notes” (as John Hammond calls them) in the fiddle in Asa Martin and Doc Robert’s 1927 recording of the Chicken Reel, and double stops, both of which were never much a part of Catskill fiddling. (Roberts)
Regional instruments in the South were the banjo, descended from Africa, and the dulcimer, made by white mountaineers. We think of Southern Appalachian instrumental music as being defined by the use of fiddle and banjo. Yet John F. Smith asked his students to list the instruments they had in their homes, and the list included French horns, trumpets, and everything else under the sun. Perhaps then, these instruments were also a part of making music in the home before radio and the recording industry defined Southern music as fiddle, banjo, guitar, and bass. (J. F. Smith)

A signature element of Southern Appalachian singing is the “catch,” or the sharp break upwards on the last note of phrases. We did not find any material we considered particularly convincing on the subject. My personal conjecture is that it might be an imitation of the abrupt cutoff of notes possible on pipes, or it might be some sort of imitation of Native American flute or war cries. That is a guess and nothing more.

Catskills

The earliest recordings we have show no backbeat, bent notes, and few syncopations. Transcriptions seem to indicate that fiddler John McDermott played with a New England sensibility. His melodies are less cluttered than their southern counterparts; the ornamentation seems to hearken to classical rather than Southern tradition. (Bronner) This is a tendency that is found among many New England players to this day. According to witnesses, he played in such a way as to facilitate contra dancing: clear, separate bow strokes; hard attacks on each note; and what Catskill hammered dulcimer player Bill Spence and Catskill fiddler George Wilson call “straight ahead New England” driving rhythm. Field recordings of fiddlers Chubb McClain and William Powers made later in the 1970’s still reflect this “square,” simplified, straight-ahead style of playing (Hartwick), as do commercial fiddle recordings of Grant Rogers. (Rogers) (Hartwick)

In short, “square” is a good word to describe the feel of Catskill music. The music of the Catskills that we listened to was uniformly so. Though minstrel shows and revival shows came to the Catskills, and some of those songs and tunes leached into the Catskill repertoire, the African-American performance style did not. Why? Because Catskillians were not hearing the music performed by black performers, but predominantly by whites.

It is likely, then, though not certain, that singing styles in the Catskills at this time (1920’s) also did not reflect Southern or Black inflection either at this point. We were not able to find any recordings of Catskill singers at this time. Later recordings reflect a style of singing that seems to stem more from Northern Irish and classical singing. This is more or less what we think of as “Northern” singing. We can conjecture that since this is what is still found in New England traditional singing and in the earliest Catskill recordings, that this was the style all along, but we cannot be sure.

Later recordings help make the case. On Songs of the Catskills, Barbara Moncure sings with a voice that would suit light opera just fine. It is light, highly placed, with a nice vibrato. It is a classical voice. Frank Warner, who was committed to imitating styles of the pieces he learned, sang in a similar way when he sang Catskill music. (Various, Folk Songs of the Catskills)
Finally, Grant Rogers sounds untrained, and straight ahead. Rogers’ repertoire, writing, persona and singing style were highly reminiscent of Kincaid: a clear, high-placed tenor reminiscent of Northern Irish and classical tenors. (Rogers)

The Catskill fiddle field recordings from the 1970’s were square, little backbeat, no bent note, little ornamentation, played at dance tempos. (Hartwick) (Jones)

One point to note about the Catskills: people made music with whatever they had. During the transitional years of the 30’s and 40’s, the same band would play swing and contra and square at a dance. (Elizabeth DiSavino, The Depth of the Well)

The Catskills don’t have a poetic local instrument like the dulcimer, but they can boast of the ukelin, manufactured in Binghamton.

**Extensions:**

Choral Arrangements: In addition to the above research, we kept our eyes open for songs that would arrange well for choir. Should funding become available at some point, it would be wonderful to commission a top-level composer to arrange some of these for choir. This might serve as an effective means to disseminate some of these wonderful pieces to school, community, college, and professional choirs across the country and perhaps around the world. Some colleges have their own published choral series. What college is in a better position to publish a series of Appalachian music arranged for choir than Berea?

A list of likely candidates is below.

- Barbara Allen – from Katherine Jackson French (variant melody)
- Cambric Shirt – from Joanne Moser (variant melody) (not pentatonic)
- Three Sisters – from John F. Smith (variant melody)
- The Weeping Lady – from John F. Smith
- Sweet Rivers of Redeeming Love – from CTM 1975
- Pretty Polly – Mary Lozier
- Oh, Liza Jane – Mary Lozier, Bradley Kincaid
- Camp a Little While in the Wilderness – Betty Smith
- Oh Hide Me Over – CTM 1975
- I Want to Die A-Shouting – Addie Graham
- Dear Friends, Farewell – Addie Graham
- Sourwood Mountain – Bradley Kincaid
- The Devil and the Farmer’s Wife – Jean Ritchie, CTM 1974
- Twilight is Stealing – Jean Ritchie, CTM 1974
Songs Suitable for the Orff Method: As I am a professor of music education here at Berea, I also kept my eyes open for pentatonic pieces that would arrange well for Orff ensemble (mallet instruments used in elementary school general music classes). Much of the Orff method is, fortunately, geared toward using pentatonic melodies, so this is a happy match. I intend the year after next to have my elementary music methods and materials class arrange some of these pieces for Orff ensemble. The list is below.

**Bradley Kincaid Collection:**

- Barbara Allen (pentatonic)
- Sourwood Mountain
- Swapping Song
- The Old Man Who Came Over the Moon
- I Gave My Love a Cherry
- Billy Boy
- Fair and Tender Ladies
- Gypsy Laddie
- Cuckoo is a Pretty Bird

**Mary Lozier**

- Oh Liza Jane
- I Never Will Marry
- Shortenin’ Bread

**Katherine Jackson French**

- Barbary Allen (different again)
- The Serving Maid

**John F. Smith**
Barbara Allen (different again)
Coo-Coo (same words as Catskills)
Fair and Tender Ladies (different)
Rowan County Crew
In Some Lonesome Valley
Johnny Riley (Wagoner’s Lad)

Joanne Moser

Cambric Shirt

Addie Graham

Dear Friends Farewell
Sisters, Art My Land Lovely?

Transcriptions: I also promised some transcriptions. The first two compare two versions of the same song. The last is a lovely melody to Barbara Allen from the Katherine Jackson French Collection. I hope that someday, Berea College will finally publish the collection of ballads compiled by this amazing woman. I would be glad to oversee the project.

Transcriptions:
Cambric Shirt (Southern Appalachian)/Petticoat Lane (Catskill)
I Gave My Love a Cherry (Southern Appalachian)/The Love Song (Catskill)
Barbara Allen, French (Southern Appalachian)

Listen: Finally, talk is cheap (and time-consuming!) but the music says it all. Here are three pieces for comparison, North and South. The first two are versions of the same piece. The last is a pairing of two different songs; in each, the singer expresses his/her love for their mountain home.
Recorded pairings of similar songs

1. **Cambric Shirt**, Joanne Moser, North Carolina
2. **Petticoat Lane**, Liza and A.J., Catskills
3. **Cuckoo**, Jean Ritchie, Kentucky (this is online at the sound archives site)
5. **In the Hills of Old Kentucky**, Bradley Kincaid, Kentucky
6. **A Home in the Catskills**, Liza and A.J., Catskills

Believe it or not, this report was the short version. We hope to do more research, North and South, and turn the final results into a book. We still have much to learn.

We would like to thank the Hutchins Library Sound Archives for this amazing opportunity. We hope we have managed to drop into place one more piece of the puzzle called “American folk music.”

Bibliography

"Addie Graham." **Interview by Barbara Kunkle.** n.d.


—. "Kincaid Collection." Berea, KY: Berea College, Hutchins Library Archives.

"Asa Martin." various.


"Celebration of Traditional Music." **Sunday Hymn Sing.** Berea, KY, 1975.

Combs, Josiah. *Folksongs of the Southern United States*, manuscript, 1925.
—. "Ballad Collection." Berea: Hutchins College Archives, Berea College.


Jones, Louis C. "Collection." New York State Historical Association.


